

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Audrey Kallander (“Kallander”) and Horizon Group USA, Inc. (“Horizon Group”), with Kallander and Horizon Group each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as the “Parties.” Kallander is an individual residing in the State of California who seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. Kallander alleges that Horizon Group is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations

Kallander alleges that Horizon Group manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California, ceramic mugs with exterior designs containing lead. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm. Kallander alleges that Horizon Group failed to provide the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65 for exposures to lead.

1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are specifically defined as, and limited to, the “*Horizon Group USA Ceramic Dog Mug;*” UPC: 1 94356 19573 9, that are manufactured, sold, or distributed for sale in California by Horizon Group (hereinafter referred to as “Products”).

1.4 Notice of Violation

On June 15, 2023, Kallander served Horizon Group USA, Inc., Target Corporation, and the requisite public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation, alleging that the notice recipients violated Proposition 65 by failing to warn

customers and consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead from the Products. No public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notices.

1.5 No Admission

Horizon Group denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notices and maintains that all of the products it has sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Horizon Group of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Horizon Group of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Horizon Group. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Horizon Group's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean August 20, 2023.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation Standards

"Reformulated Products" are defined as those Products that: (a) contain no more than 90 parts per million ("ppm") lead in any decoration, colored artwork, designs and/or marking on the surface of the Products when analyzed pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3050B or equivalent methodologies utilized by federal or state agencies for the purpose of determining lead content in a solid substance; (b) yield no more than 1.0 microgram of lead on any surface sampled and analyzed pursuant to the NIOSH 9100 testing protocol; and (c) yield a result of non-detect (defined as no more than 25 ppm by weight of lead) for any decorations located in the upper 20

millimeters of a Product, i.e., the “Lip-and-Rim” area when analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies 3050B and 6010B, or equivalent methodologies used by state and federal agencies to determine lead content in a solid substance.

If the decoration is tested after it is affixed to the Product, the percentage of the lead by weight must relate only to the decorating materials and must not include any quantity attributable to non-decorating material (e.g., ceramic substrate).

2.2 Reformulation/Warning Commitment


As of the Effective Date, Horizon Group shall not manufacture, import, distribute, sell or offer the Products for sale in the State of California unless they are Reformulated Products pursuant to Section 2.1 or bear a warning pursuant to Section 2.3. The Parties agree and intend that compliance with the terms of this Settlement Agreement shall constitute compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to Lead from the Products.

2.3 Warnings

As of the Effective Date, all Products Horizon Group sells and/or distributes for sale in California that do not qualify as Reformulated Products, shall bear a clear and reasonable warning pursuant to this Section. Horizon Group further agrees that the warning will be prominently placed with such conspicuousness when compared with other words, statements, designs or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Products shall contain one of the following statements:

 **WARNING:** Reproductive Harm- www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

OR

 **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov

The above warning statements shall also include a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a bold black outline. Where the label is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the text of the warning, in a size no smaller than the height of the word “WARNING.”

If Horizon Group sells Products via its own proprietary internet website to customers located in California, the warning requirements of this section shall be satisfied if the foregoing warning appears either: (a) on the same web page on which a Product is displayed and/or described; (b) on the same page as the price for the Product; (c) on one or more web pages displayed to a California purchaser prior to completion of the checkout process. Alternatively, a symbol consisting of a black exclamation point in a yellow or white equilateral triangle may appear adjacent to or immediately following the display, description, price, or checkout listing of the Product, if the warning statement appears elsewhere on the same web page in a manner that clearly associates it with the product(s) to which the warning applies.

The parties acknowledge that the warnings required by this section are not the exclusive methods of providing Proposition 65 warnings and agree that Horizon Group may utilize “safe harbor” warning language and methods of transmission promulgated by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment without being deemed in breach of this Settlement Agreement.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b)(2), and as consideration for the releases contained in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 below, Horizon Group agrees to pay \$2,500 in civil penalties no later than seven days after the Effective Date. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount paid to Kallander. Horizon Group will make its payment in two checks, delivered to the address in Section 3.3, as follows: (1) to “OEHHA” in the amount of \$1,875; and (2) to “Audrey Kallander” in the amount of \$625.

3.2 Attorneys’ Fees and Costs

The Parties acknowledge that Kallander and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to her counsel, thereby leaving the issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Shortly after the other settlement terms had been reached, Horizon Group expressed a desire to resolve Kallander’s fees and costs. The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to Kallander’s counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5 for all work performed in this matter. Under these legal principles, on or before seven days after the Effective Date, Horizon Group agrees to pay \$19,500, in the form of a check made payable to “Voorhees & Bailey, LLP,” for all fees and costs incurred investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Horizon Group’s management, and negotiating a settlement.

3.3 Payment Address

All payments under this Settlement Agreement shall be delivered to the following address:

Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
990 Amarillo Avenue
Palo Alto, CA 94303

4. KALLANDER'S RELEASE

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to Sections 3.1 and 3.2 above, Kallander, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims relating to the Products manufactured, imported, distributed or sold prior the Effective Date, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees and attorneys' fees) of any nature whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively "Claims"), against (a) Horizon Group, (b) each of Horizon Group downstream distributors, wholesalers, vendors, licensors, licensees, auctioneers, retailers, franchisees, dealers, shareholders, cooperative members, customers, owners, purchasers, and users, (c) each of Horizon Group's upstream vendors and entities that manufactured the Products or any component parts thereof for Horizon Group, (d) Target Corporation, and its corporate affiliates, subsidiaries, and each of their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents, employees, and sister and parent entities, and (e) Horizon Group's parent companies, corporate affiliates, subsidiaries, and their respective officers, directors, attorneys, representatives, shareholders, agents, and employees, and sister and parent entities (collectively "Releasees").

Kallander also, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees and *not* in her representative capacity, provides a general release herein which shall be effective as a full and final accord and satisfaction, as a bar to all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees,

damages, losses, claims, liabilities and demands of any nature, character or kind, known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, against Horizon Group and the Releasees related to Products manufactured, imported, distribute or sold prior to the Effective Date.

Kallander acknowledges that she is familiar with California Civil Code section 1542, which provides as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Kallander, in her capacity only, and on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees expressly waives and relinquishes any and all rights and benefits which it may have under, or which may be conferred on it by the provisions of California Civil Code section 1542 as well as under any other state or federal statute or common law principle of similar effect, to the fullest extent that it may lawfully waive such rights or benefits pertaining to the released matters.

5. HORIZON GROUP'S RELEASE OF KALLANDER

Horizon Group, on its own behalf, and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Kallander and her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made by Kallander and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Products.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Horizon Group may provide written notice to Kallander of any asserted change in the law and shall have no further injunctive obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

8. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For Horizon Group:

David Callet
CalletLaw, LLC
5335 Wisconsin Ave. NW, Suite 440
Washington, D.C. 20015

For Kallander:

Audrey Kallander
c/o Voorhees & Bailey, LLP
Proposition 65 Coordinator
535 Ramona St.; Suite 5
Palo Alto, CA 94301

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

9. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Kallander and her attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

12. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understand, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: _____

Date: 8/17/2023

By: _____
AUDREY KALLANDER

By: Robert Almerini
HORIZON GROUP USA, INC.

10. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Kallander and her attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(f).

11. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

12. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understand, and agreed to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: Aug 17, 2023

Date: _____

By:  _____
AUDREY KALLANDER

By: _____
HORIZON GROUP USA, INC.