

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. ("EHA"), on the one hand, and Brighton-Best International, Inc. ("Brighton-Best"), on the other hand, with EHA and Brighton-Best each individually referred to as a "Party" and collectively as the "Parties." EHA is a corporation in the State of California serving in the interest of the general public by seeking to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. EHA alleges that Brighton-Best is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* ("Proposition 65").

1.2 General Allegations

EHA alleges that Brighton-Best manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California an electrical tape product that contains Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP") and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer.

1.3 Product Description

The product covered by this Settlement Agreement is defined as black vinyl electrical tape including, but not limited to, Proferred Vinyl Electrical Tape ("Covered Product"), that is manufactured, sold or distributed for sale in California by Brighton-Best directly or through distributors.

1.4 Notice of Violation

On or around September 12, 2023, EHA served Brighton-Best, the California Attorney General, and certain other public enforcement agencies (EHA believes required) with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 ("Notice"). The Notice alleged that Brighton-Best had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to DEHP contained in the Covered Product.

To the best of the parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

1.5 No Admission

Brighton-Best denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and maintains that all of the products it sold and/or distributed for sale in California, including the Covered Product, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Brighton-Best of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Brighton-Best of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Brighton-Best. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Brighton-Best's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Brighton-Best maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, or sold or caused to be sold into, California the Covered Product in violation of Proposition 65 within a minimum of three years before the date of the Notice.

1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Settlement Agreement is last executed by the Parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 General Warning Requirements


(a) Within thirty days from the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Brighton-Best agrees to provide a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in §§ 2.1 and 2.2 and it agrees that it shall not sell in California, or distribute for sale in California, the Covered Product, unless accompanied by warnings provided for in Section 2.1. "Distribute for sale in California" means to directly ship Covered Product into California or to sell a Covered Product to a customer or distributor Brighton-Best International, Inc. knows will sell a Covered Product in California.

Brighton-Best agrees that each warning shall be prominently placed with such


conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Covered Product the warning applies, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

(b) Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Product shall consist of a warning affixed directly to the packaging, label, or tag, of each Covered Product distributed for sale in California, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process that contains one of the following statements:

- 1)  **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including Di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate ("DEHP"), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

OR

- 2)  **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

The triangle above shall be yellow on the warning statement. This warning statement shall be prominently displayed on the Covered Product, on the packing of the Covered Product, or on a placard, shelf tag, or sign provided that the statement is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. If the warning statement is displayed on the Covered Product's packaging, it must be in a type size no smaller than the largest type size used for other consumer information on the product. In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Product's packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. If the Covered Product's packaging contains consumer information in a foreign language, a warning statement in that language is required. The same warning shall be posted on any websites under the exclusive

control of Brighton-Best where Covered Product is sold into California. This requirement shall apply to Covered Product manufactured and sold or distributed for sale in California after the Effective Date. There shall be no obligation for Brighton-Best to provide a warning for the Covered Product that entered the stream of commerce, or was imported, ordered, purchased or manufactured prior to the Effective Date, and the Section 4 release applies to all such Covered Product.

(c) Internet Sales

If Brighton-Best sells the Product via an internet website to customers located in California, an acceptable warning under this Agreement shall be satisfied if compliant with California Code of Regulations title 27 section 25602(b). Acceptable warnings can include that appear either: (a) on the same web page on which a Product is displayed and/or described; (b) on one or more web pages displayed to a purchaser prior to purchase during the checkout process; or (c) by use of the word **WARNING** with a hyperlink to a warning under section 2.1.

2.2 Compliance and Changes in Warning Regulations or Statutes

The Parties agree that Brighton-Best shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Settlement Agreement by adhering to § 2.1, or by complying with warning requirements adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") after the Effective Date.

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting Proposition 65 warning text and/or methods of transmission applicable to the Covered Product and the chemical at issue, which are different than those set forth above, Brighton-Best shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement. If regulations or legislation are enacted providing that Proposition 65 warnings as to DEHP in this product are no longer required, a lack of warning by Brighton-Best will not thereafter be a breach of this Agreement.

2.3 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Covered Product

The injunctive requirements of Section 2 shall not apply to Covered Product that has already been placed in the stream of commerce, or was imported, ordered, purchased or manufactured prior

to the Effective Date, and such Covered Product is expressly subject to the releases provided in Section 4.1. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Product in the stream of commerce specifically includes, but is not limited to, Covered Product in the process of manufacture, or in the process of being ordered or purchased by a Brighton-Best customer, including distributors.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all claims alleged in the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Brighton-Best agrees to pay one thousand five hundred (\$1,500.00) in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount retained by EHA. Brighton-Best shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” and (b) Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. as follows:

- One payment of \$1,125.00 to OEHHA, due 30 (thirty) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$375.00 to EHA, due 14 (fourteen) days after the Effective Date.

All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

All penalty payments owed to EHA shall be sent to:

Isaac Fayman
Environmental Health Advocates
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.2 Attorney Fees and Costs

The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to EHA and its counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, Brighton-Best agrees to pay thirteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$13,500.00) to EHA and its counsel for all fees and costs incurred in investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Brighton-Best, and negotiating a settlement. The thirteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$13,500.00) in Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be payable to Entorno Law, LLP as follows: One payment of \$13,500.00, due thirty (30) days after the Effective Date.

All payments required under this Section shall be delivered to:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.3 Tax Documentation

Brighton-Best agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and EHA agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the payees under this Settlement Agreement. The Parties acknowledge that Brighton-Best cannot issue any settlement payments pursuant to Section 3.1 and 3.2 above until after Brighton-Best receives the requisite W-9 forms from EHA's counsel.

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 EHA's Release of Brighton-Best

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution of all claims between EHA, on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, and Brighton-Best for all claims that can or could have been asserted by EHA, on its own behalf, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees, against Brighton-Best and each of its

respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, attorneys, and any entity, including, but not limited to each entity to whom Brighton-Best directly or indirectly distributes or distributed, or sells or sold, the Covered Product, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers (including but not limited to Carrlu Company, Inc. and Proferred Tools), franchisees, cooperative members and licensees (“Releasees”), based on the failure to warn about exposures to DEHP required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Product manufactured, sold or distributed for sale in California, whether to a direct customer or to a distributor, by Brighton-Best before the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice, or for any other reason

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, EHA on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees hereby waives any and all rights it may have to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims against Brighton-Best and Releasees including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees and attorney fees arising under Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to DEHP required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Product manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by Brighton-Best, before the Effective Date.

4.2 Brighton-Best’s Release of EHA

Brighton-Best, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Product.

4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Product will develop or be discovered. EHA on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Brighton-Best on behalf of itself only, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

EHA and Brighton-Best each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

5 PUBLIC BENEFIT

It is Brighton-Best's understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Brighton-Best under this Settlement Agreement confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Brighton-Best that to the extent any other private party serves a notice and/or initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Brighton-Best's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning actual or alleged exposure to DEHP prior to use of the Covered Product it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Product addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Brighton-Best is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining

provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

8. ENFORCEMENT

In any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. The Parties shall first attempt to meet and confer to informally resolve the claim with the Party alleging a violation of the Settlement Agreement providing written notice to the other Party 30 days before initiating an action to enforce setting forth the grounds of the Agreement it alleges require enforcement.

9. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For Brighton-Best:

Dennis Raglin
Steptoe & Johnson LLP
633 West Fifth Street, Suite 1900
Los Angeles, CA 90071
draglin@steptoe.com

For EHA:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

EHA and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

12. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

13. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: 11/13/23

Date: Nov 13, 2023

By: 

By:  / Jun Xu

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
ADVOCATES, INC.

BRIGHTON-BEST INTERNATIONAL, INC.