

1 **ENTORNO LAW, LLP**

Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444)

2 Noam Glick (SBN 251582)

Jake W. Schulte (SBN 293777)

3 Janani Natarajan (SBN 346770)

225 Broadway, Suite 1900

4 San Diego, California 92101

Tel: (619) 629-0527

5 Email: craig@entornolaw.com

Email: noam@entornolaw.com

6 Email: jake@entornolaw.com

Email: janani@entornolaw.com

7  
8 Attorneys for Plaintiff

Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.

9  
10 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

11 **IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA**

12 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH  
13 ADVOCATES, INC.,

14 Plaintiff,

15 v.

16 ANCIENT BRANDS, LLC., a Florida limited  
17 liability corporation; BRISTOL FARMS., a  
18 California corporation; AMAZON.COM,  
19 INC., a Delaware corporation; and DOES 1  
20 through 100, inclusive,

21 Defendants.

Case No. 24CV078455

**[PROPOSED] CONSENT JUDGMENT**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* and  
Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 **1.1 Parties**

3 This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.,  
4 (“EHA” or “Plaintiff”) and Ancient Brands, LLC., (“Defendant” or “Ancient Brands”) with EHA and  
5 Ancient Brands each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively referred to as the “Parties.”

6 **1.2 Plaintiff**

7 EHA is a corporation organized in the state of California, acting in the interest of the general  
8 public. It seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by  
9 reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

10 **1.3 Defendant**

11 Ancient Brands employs ten or more individuals and for purposes of this Consent Judgment  
12 only, is a “person in the course of doing business” for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic  
13 Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

14 **1.4 General Allegations**

15 EHA alleges that Ancient Brands manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale Ancient  
16 Nutrition Plant Protein + Berry that contains lead. EHA further alleges that Ancient Brands does so  
17 without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65 and related  
18 Regulations. Ancient Brands denies these allegations and asserts that its products are safe and in  
19 compliance with all applicable laws, rules and regulations.

20 **1.5 Notice of Violation**

21 On or around February 29, 2024, EHA served Defendant Ancient Brands, LLC., Bristol Farms.,  
22 Amazon.com, Inc., the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies  
23 with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 (“Notice”). The Notice alleged that Ancient  
24 Brands had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health  
25 hazards associated with exposures to lead contained in dietary supplements products, including but not  
26 limited Ancient Nutrition Plant Protein + Berry manufactured or processed by Ancient Brands that  
27 allegedly contain lead and are imported, sold, shipped, delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers  
28 in California by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1).

1 No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the  
2 violations alleged in the Notice.

### 3 **1.6 Product Description**

4 The products covered by this Consent Judgment are Ancient Nutrition Plant Protein + products,  
5 including but not limited to Berry and Vanilla, manufactured or processed by Ancient Brands that  
6 allegedly contain lead and are imported, sold, shipped, delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers  
7 in California by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1) (“Covered Products”).

### 8 **1.7 State of the Pleadings**

9 On or around June 4, 2024, EHA filed a Complaint against Ancient Brands for the alleged  
10 violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice (“Complaint”).

### 11 **1.8 No Admission**

12 Ancient Brands denies the material factual and legal allegations of the Notice and Complaint  
13 and maintains that all of the products it has manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in  
14 California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all applicable laws,  
15 rules and regulations. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact,  
16 finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent  
17 Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation  
18 of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Ancient Brands's obligations,  
19 responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

### 20 **1.9 Jurisdiction**

21 For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this  
22 Court has jurisdiction over Ancient Brands as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper  
23 in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this  
24 Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

### 25 **1.10 Effective Date**

26 For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Effective Date” means the date on which this  
27 Consent Judgment is approved by the Court, as discussed in Section 5.

28 ///

1           **1.11 Compliance Date**

2           For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Compliance Date” means 60 days from the  
3 date on which this Consent Judgment is approved and entered as a judgment of the Court, as discussed  
4 in Section 5.

5           **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

6           **2.1 Reformulation of the Covered Products**

7           Beginning on or before the Compliance Date, Ancient Brands shall be permanently enjoined  
8 from manufacturing, distributing, or directly selling in the State of California, any Covered Product  
9 that exposes a person to a “Daily Lead Exposure Level” of more than 0.5 micrograms of lead based on  
10 a single serving per day unless such Covered Products comply with the warning requirements of  
11 Section 2.2. The “Daily Lead Exposure Level” shall be calculated by multiplying the recommended  
12 serving size in Covered Product by the concentration of lead in Covered Products. As used in this  
13 Section 2, “distributed for sale in CA” means to directly ship Covered Products into California or to  
14 sell Covered Products to a distributor Ancient Brands knows will sell Covered Products in California.

15           **2.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings**

16           For Covered Products that contain lead in a concentration exceeding the Reformulation  
17 Standard set forth in section 2.1 above, and which are distributed or directly sold by Ancient Brands in  
18 the State of California on or after the Compliance Date, Ancient Brands shall provide one of the  
19 following warning statements.

20           **Option 1:**

21                   WARNING: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals  
22                   including Lead, which are known to the State of California to cause  
23                   cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more  
                    information, go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food).

24           **Option 2:**

25                   WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm –  
                    [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food).

26           One of the above warning statements shall be enclosed in a box and prominently displayed on  
27 the Covered Products, on the packing of the Covered Products, or on a placard, shelf tag, or sign  
28 provided that the statement is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words,

1 statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual prior  
2 to sale. If the warning statement is displayed on the Covered Products' packaging, it must be in a type  
3 size no smaller than the largest type size used for other "consumer information" on the product, as that  
4 term is defined in Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, §25600.1. In no case shall a warning statement displayed  
5 on the Covered Products' packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. If the Covered  
6 Products' packaging contains consumer information in a foreign language, a warning statement in that  
7 language is required. The same warning shall be posted on any websites under the exclusive control of  
8 Ancient Brands where Covered Products are sold into California. Ancient Brands shall instruct any  
9 third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered Products to include the same warning as a  
10 condition of selling the Covered Products in California. Any website warning must comply with all  
11 regulations set forth in this section.

### 12 **2.3 Sell-Through Period**

13 Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, Covered Products that are  
14 manufactured, packaged, or put into commerce on or after the date this Agreement is executed shall be  
15 subject to the release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such  
16 Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligations  
17 of Ancient Brands, or any Releasees (if applicable), stated in this Section 2 do not apply to Covered  
18 Products manufactured, packaged, or put into commerce between the date this Agreement is executed  
19 and the Effective Date.

## 20 **3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS**

### 21 **3.1 Settlement Amount**

22 Ancient Brands shall pay fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000.00) in settlement and total satisfaction  
23 of all the claims referred to in the Notice(s), the Complaint, and this Consent Judgment. This includes  
24 civil penalties in the amount of five thousand dollars (\$5,000.00) pursuant to Health and Safety Code  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 section 25249.7(b) and attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of forty-five thousand dollars  
2 (\$45,000.00) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

### 3 **3.2 Civil Penalty**

4 The portion of the settlement attributable to civil penalties shall be allocated according to Health  
5 and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid  
6 to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining  
7 twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty paid to EHA individually. The five thousand dollars  
8 (\$5,000.00) in civil penalties shall be paid as follows:

- 9 • One payment of \$3,750.00 to OEHHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.
- 10 • One payment of \$1,250.00 to EHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective date.

11 All payments owed to EHA shall be delivered to the following address:

12  
13 Isaac Fayman  
14 Environmental Health Advocates  
225 Broadway, Suite 2100  
San Diego, CA 92101

15 All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to OEHHA  
16 (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

17 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

18  
19 Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
20 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010  
21 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

22 For Federal Express 2-Day Delivery:

23 Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
24 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
25 Sacramento, CA 95814

26 Ancient Brands agrees to provide EHA's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHA,  
27 simultaneous with its penalty payment to EHA.  
28

1 Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required.  
2 Relevant information is set out below:

- 3 • “Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.” (EIN: 84-2322975) at the address provided above.
- 4 • “Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment” 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

5 All payments referenced in this section shall be paid within fourteen (14) days of the date the  
6 Court approves EHA’s motion to approve this Consent Judgment.

### 7 **3.3 Attorney’s Fees and Costs**

8 The portion of the settlement attributable to attorneys’ fees and costs shall be paid to EHA’s  
9 counsel, who are entitled to attorneys’ fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not  
10 limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Ancient Brands’s attention, as well  
11 as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

12 Ancient Brands shall provide its payment for civil penalty and for attorneys’ fees and costs to  
13 EHA’s counsel by physical check or by electronic means, including wire transfers, at Ancient Brands’s  
14 discretion, as follows: forty-five thousand dollars (\$45,000.00) in Attorney’s Fees and Costs shall be  
15 paid as one payment, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

16 The attorney fee payments shall be made payable to Entorno Law, LLP. The address for this  
17 entity is:

18 Noam Glick  
19 Entorno Law, LLP  
20 225 Broadway, Suite 1900  
21 San Diego, CA 92101

## 22 **4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

### 23 **4.1 EHA’s Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims**

24 Plaintiff, acting on its own behalf and in the public interest, releases Ancient Brands, and its  
25 parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership or control, its directors, officers,  
26 principals, agents, employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, predecessors, successors, and assigns  
27 (“Defendant Entities”), each entity to whom Defendant directly or indirectly distributes, ships, or sells  
28 the Covered Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers,  
retailers (including but not limited to Bristol Farms and Amazon.com, Inc.), and marketplaces

1 franchisees, franchisors, cooperative members, suppliers, licensees, and licensors, and all of the  
2 foregoing entities' owners, directors, officers, agents, principals, employees, attorneys, insurers,  
3 accountants, representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns (collectively referred to as the  
4 "Releasees") from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Effective Date based on  
5 exposure to lead from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice(s). Compliance with the terms of this  
6 Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures to lead from  
7 Covered Products as set forth in the Notice(s). This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding  
8 resolution of all claims under Proposition 65 that were or could have been asserted against Ancient  
9 Brands and/or Releasees for failure to comply with Proposition 65 for alleged exposure to lead from  
10 Covered Products. This release does not extend to any third-party retailers selling the product on a  
11 website who, after receiving instruction from Ancient Brands to include a warning as set forth above  
12 in section 2.2, do not include such a warning.

#### 13 **4.2 EHA's Individual Release of Claims**

14 EHA, in its individual capacity, also provides a release to Ancient Brands and/or Releasees,  
15 which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions, causes of action,  
16 obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of every  
17 nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of  
18 alleged or actual exposures to lead in Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed  
19 by Ancient Brands before the Effective Date.

#### 20 **4.3 Ancient Brands's Release of EHA**

21 Ancient Brands on its own behalf, and on behalf of Releasees as well as its past and current  
22 agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against  
23 EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by  
24 EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims,  
25 otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against them, in this matter or with respect to the Covered  
26 Products.



1           **4.4 No Other Known Claims or Violations**

2           EHA and EHA’s counsel affirm that they are not presently aware of any actual or alleged  
3 violations of Proposition 65 by Ancient Brands or for which Ancient Brands bears legal  
4 responsibility other than those that are fully resolved by this Consent Judgment.

5           **5. COURT APPROVAL**

6           This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and  
7 void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or  
8 by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

9           **6. SEVERABILITY**

10           Subsequent to the Court’s approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held  
11 by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

12           **7. GOVERNING LAW**

13           The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California as  
14 applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise  
15 rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law, then Ancient Brands  
16 may provide written notice to EHA of any asserted change, and shall have no further injunctive  
17 obligations pursuant to this Consent Judgment with respect to, and to the extent that, the Covered  
18 Products are so affected.

19           In the event the California Office of Health Hazard Assessment adopts a regulation or safe use  
20 determination, or issues an interpretive guideline that exempts Covered Products from meeting the  
21 requirements of Proposition 65; or if lead cases are permanently enjoined by a court of competent  
22 jurisdiction; or if Proposition 65 is determined to be preempted by federal law or a burden on First  
23 Amendment rights with respect to lead in Covered Products or Covered Products substantially similar  
24 to Covered Products, then Ancient Brands shall be relieved of its obligation to comply with Section 2  
25 herein.

1 **8. ENFORCEMENT**

2 In any action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be entitled  
3 to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

4 **9. NOTICE**

5 Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent  
6 Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified  
7 mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier; and (iv) with a copy by email; to  
8 the following addresses:

9 If to Ancient Brands:

10 Damon M. Pitt  
11 Venable LLP  
12 2049 Century Park East, St. 2300  
Los Angeles, CA 90067  
DMPitt@Venable.com

If to EHA:

Noam Glick  
Entorno Law, LLP  
225 Broadway, Suite 2100  
San Diego, CA 92101  
noam@entornolaw.com

13 Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which  
14 notices and other communications shall be sent.

15 **10. COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES**

16 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of  
17 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the  
18 same document.

19 **11. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES**

20 EHA agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety  
21 Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code  
22 section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which  
23 motion EHA shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually  
24 employ their reasonable best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this  
25 agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For  
26 purposes of this Section, "best efforts" shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval,  
27 responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing before the  
28 Court if so requested.

1 **12. MODIFICATION**

2 This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of  
3 a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any  
4 Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

5 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

6 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they  
7 have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

8 **14. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES**

9 If a dispute arises with respect to either Party’s compliance with the terms of this Consent  
10 Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, or by telephone, and/or in  
11 writing and endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be filed  
12 in the absence of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand.

13 **15. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**


14 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties  
15 with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations,  
16 commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or  
17 implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or  
18 otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.

19 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

20  
21 Date: 08/13/2024

Date: 8/12/24

22 By:   
23 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH  
24 ADVOCATES, INC.

By:   
ANCIENT BRANDS, INC.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT