

1 Evan Smith (Bar No. SBN 242352)
2 BRODSKY SMITH
3 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300
4 Beverly Hills, CA 90212
5 Tel: (877) 534-2590
6 Fax: (310) 247-0160

7 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

8
9 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

11 EMA BELL,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 PALADONE PRODUCTS INC., WORLD OF
15 JEANS & TOPS DBA TILLY'S, TILLY'S,
16 INC.,

17 Defendants.

Case No.: CGC-25-623084

**[PROPOSED] CONSENT
JUDGMENT**

Judge: Joseph M. Quinn

Dept.: 302

Hearing Date: April 28, 2026

Hearing Time: 9:00 AM

Complaint Filed: March 7, 2025

1 **1. INTRODUCTION**

2 1.1 **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiffs Ema
3 Bell (“Bell”) and Precila Balabbo (“Balabbo”) (collectively, “Plaintiffs” and each a “Plaintiff”)
4 acting on behalf of the public interest and defendant Paladone Products Inc. (“Paladone” or
5 “Defendant”) with Plaintiffs and Defendant collectively referred to as the “Parties” and each of
6 them as a “Party.” Balabbo and Bell are each an individual residing in California that seeks to
7 promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or
8 eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Paladone is alleged to be a
9 person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code
10 §§ 25249.6 et seq.

11 1.2 **Allegations and Representations.** Plaintiffs allege that Defendant has exposed
12 individuals to lead from its sales of (a) *Ted Lasso*™ mugs, (b) Paladone Products Assassins Creed
13 gauntlet mugs, and (c) *Playstation*™ 4th generation controller mugs without providing a clear and
14 reasonable exposure warning pursuant to Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65
15 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other
16 reproductive harm.

17 1.3 **Notices of Violation/Action.**

18 1.3.1 On March 7, 2024, Bell served Paladone, Tilly’s, Inc., and various public
19 enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health &
20 Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “First March Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition
21 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of *Ted Lasso*™ mugs exposes users in
22 California to lead. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged
23 in the First March Notice. On March 7, 2025, Bell filed a complaint in the Superior Court of
24 California, County of San Francisco, and docketed to Case No. CGC-25-623084, relating to the
25 claims found in the First March Notice (the “First Complaint”).

1 1.3.2 On March 7, 2024, Balabbo served Paladone and various public enforcement
2 agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code
3 §25249.7(d) (the “Second March Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for
4 failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Paladone Products Assassins Creed gauntlet
5 mugs exposes users in California to lead. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently
6 prosecuting the claims alleged in the Second March Notice. On March 7, 2025, Balabbo filed a
7 complaint in the Superior Court of California, County of San Francisco, and docketed to Case No.
8 CGC-25-623089, relating to the claims found in the Second March Notice (the “Second
9 Complaint”).

10 1.3.3 On March 22, 2024, Bell served Paladone, The TJX Companies, Inc., and
11 various public enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation”
12 pursuant to Health & Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “Third March Notice”)¹, alleging that
13 Defendant violated Proposition 65 for failing to warn consumers and customers that use of
14 *Playstation*TM 4th generation controller mugs exposes users in California to lead. No public
15 enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged in the Third March Notice.
16 On March 18, 2025, Bell filed a complaint in the Superior Court of California, County of San
17 Francisco, and docketed to Case No. CGC-25-623411, relating to the claims found in the Third
18 March Notice (the “Third Complaint”).

19 1.3.4 On November 6, 2025, Plaintiff filed a Notice of Related Case as to the First
20 Complaint, Second Complaint, and Third Complaint².

21 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has
22 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Related Action filed in this matter,
23 that venue is proper in the County of San Francisco, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve,
24 enter, and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution

25 _____
26 ¹ The First March Notice, Second March Notice, and Third March Notice are collectively referred
to herein as, the “Notices.”

27 ² The First Complaint, Second Complaint, and Third Complaint are collectively referred to herein
28 as, the “Related Action.”

1 of all claims which were or could have been raised in the Related Action based on the facts alleged
2 therein and in the Notices.

3 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations contained in Plaintiffs' Notices and
4 Related Action and maintains that it has not violated Proposition 65. Nothing in this Consent
5 Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, issue of law, or
6 violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment constitute or be construed as an
7 admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such
8 being specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall not diminish or otherwise affect
9 the obligations, responsibilities, and duties of Defendant under this Consent Judgment.

10 **2. DEFINITIONS**

11 2.1 **Covered Products.** The products covered by this Consent Judgment are mugs or
12 other ceramic drinkware that bears intellectual property or branding from video-game or television
13 brands or other licensed material, including without limitation (a) *Ted Lasso*TM mugs, (b) Assassins
14 Creed mugs, and (c) *Playstation*TM mugs that are manufactured, distributed, or shipped into
15 California by Paladone and sold or offered for sale in California by Paladone or Downstream
16 Releasees (as defined in § 5.1) ("Covered Products").

17 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term "Effective Date" means the date notice of entry of this
18 Consent Judgment is provided to counsel for all Parties.

19 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS**

20 3.1 **Reformulation of the Covered Products.** Commencing within ninety (90) days
21 after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Paladone directly
22 manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either be: (a)
23 Reformulated Covered Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; or (b) labeled with a clear and reasonable
24 exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3 - 3.4, below. For purposes of this Consent Judgment, a
25 "Reformulated Covered Product" is a Covered Product that is in compliance with the standard set
26 forth in § 3.2, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 - 3.4 shall not apply to any
27 Reformulated Covered Product. The Parties agree and intend that Paladone's compliance with the
28

1 terms of this Consent Judgment shall constitute its compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to
2 exposures to lead from the Covered Products.

3 **3.2 Reformulation Standard.** “Reformulated Covered Products” shall mean Covered
4 Products that produce a wipe test result no higher than 1 microgram (µg) of lead when analyzed
5 pursuant to NIOSH method no. 9100.

6 **3.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning.** Commencing within 90 days after the Effective
7 Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.3
8 and 3.4 must be provided for all Covered Products that Paladone manufactures, imports, distributes,
9 sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Covered Product. There shall be no
10 obligation for Paladone to provide an exposure warning for Covered Products that entered the
11 stream of commerce within 90 days after the Effective Date. The warning shall consist of either the
12 **Warning or Alternative Warning** described in §§ 3.3(a) or (b), respectively:

13 (a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

14 **⚠ WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which
15 is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other
reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

16 (b) **Alternative Warning:** Paladone may, but is not required to, use the
17 alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

18 **⚠ WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

19 **3.4 A Warning or Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word
20 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to
21 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral
22 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use
23 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller
24 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The **Warning or Alternative Warning** shall be affixed
25 to or printed on the Covered Products’ packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or
26 electronic device or automatic process only if such electronic device or automatic process provides
27 the **Warning or Alternative Warning** without the purchaser having to seek it out, provided that
28 the **Warning or Alternative Warning** is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with

1 other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary
2 individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**
3 provided via an electronic device or automatic process does not apply to internet purchases, which
4 are subject to the provisions of Section 25602(b). The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** may be
5 contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other
6 safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same
7 size as those other safety warnings. If “consumer information,” as that term is defined in Title 27,
8 California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.1(c) as it may be amended from time to time, is
9 provided in a foreign language, Paladone shall provide the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** in
10 the foreign language in accordance with applicable warning regulations adopted by the State of
11 California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”). An **Alternative**
12 **Warning** on a Covered Product manufactured and labeled after January 1, 2028 shall be provided
13 in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, § 25603(b).

14 In addition to affixing the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** to the Covered Product’s
15 packaging or labeling, the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** shall be posted on websites where
16 Paladone offers Covered Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this
17 Section shall be satisfied if the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**, or a clearly marked hyperlink
18 using the word “**WARNING,**” appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently
19 displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this
20 Section, Paladone shall (a) post the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** on its own website and, if
21 it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers; and (b) if it does not
22 have the ability to post the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** on the websites of its third-party
23 internet sellers, provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California
24 Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Covered Products that
25 have been provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations,
26 Section 25600.2 are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning
27 requirements of this Section.

1 **3.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** The Parties agree that Paladone shall be
2 deemed to be in compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to § 3 of this Consent
3 Judgment or by complying with warning regulations adopted by the State of California’s OEHHA
4 applicable to the Covered Product and the exposure at issue.

5 **3.6 Covenant Not to Sue Or Assert Further Claims or Notices of Violations.** For
6 any Covered Product that meets the Reformulation Standard defined in § 3.2, Plaintiff shall not
7 assert, initiate, maintain, or support any further Proposition 65 enforcement action relating to lead
8 exposure from such Covered Products.

9 **4. MONETARY TERMS**

10 **4.1 Civil Penalty.** Paladone shall pay \$3,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to Health
11 and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with Health and Safety Code
12 section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining
13 25% of the Civil Penalty remitted to Plaintiffs.

14 4.1.1 Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Paladone shall issue two
15 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$2,250.00; (b)
16 “Ema Bell” in the amount of \$500.00; and to (b) “Precila Balabbo” in the amount of \$250.00.
17 Payment owed to Plaintiffs pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment
18 address:

19 Evan J. Smith, Esquire
20 Brodsky Smith
21 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805
22 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

23 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly
24 to OEHHA (Memo Line “Prop 65 Penalties”) at one of the following address(es):

25 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

26 Mike Gyurics
27 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
28 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
 P.O. Box 4010
 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

1 Mike Gyurics
2 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
3 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
4 1001 I Street
5 Sacramento, CA 95814

6 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky Smith at the address set forth
7 above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

8 4.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Paladone shall pay
9 \$30,000.00 to Brodsky Smith as complete reimbursement for Plaintiffs' attorneys' fees and costs
10 incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Paladone, litigating and
11 negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code
12 of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

13 4.3 **Payment by Wire.** Paladone may also pay all monies due pursuant to this
14 Agreement by wire transfer. If Paladone elects to pay by wire transfer, Paladone may send the entire
15 amount to Brodsky Smith and Brodsky Smith shall be responsible for allocating the monies to the
16 appropriate entities as outlined in Section 4.

17 **5. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

18 5.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiffs
19 acting on their own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Paladone, and its parents,
20 shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents,
21 attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their
22 predecessors, successors and assigns ("Defendant Releasees"), and all entities to whom they
23 directly or indirectly distribute or sell the Covered Products, including but not limited to
24 manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees retailers,
25 including but not limited to Tilly's, Inc., The TJX Companies, Inc., their parents, subsidiaries, and
26 affiliates, franchisees, and cooperative members ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims for
27 violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to lead from use of the Covered Products
28 manufactured, distributed, or sold by Paladone in California within 90 days after the Effective Date,
as set forth in the Notices. This Consent Judgment shall have preclusive effect such that no other

1 actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to act in his, her, or its interests or the public
2 interest, shall be permitted with respect to any Proposition 65 Claims (defined *supra*), including
3 any such claims as alleged in the Related Action, and any other violation of Proposition 65 based
4 on exposure to lead from Covered Products, that was or could have been brought pursuant to the
5 Notices naming Paladone or the Downstream Releasees. Paladone's compliance with the terms of
6 this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Paladone with regard to
7 exposure to lead from use of the Covered Products.

8 5.2 In addition to the foregoing, Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves, their past and
9 current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and assignees, and *not* in their
10 representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly,
11 any form of legal action and releases Paladone, Defendant Releasees, and Downstream Releasees
12 from any and all manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations,
13 debts, contracts, agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, expenses, and
14 attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown, in law or equity, fixed or contingent,
15 now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of Proposition 65 related to or arising
16 from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Paladone, Defendant Releasees or
17 Downstream Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this paragraph,
18 Plaintiffs hereby specifically waive any and all rights and benefits which they now have, or in the
19 future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the California Civil Code, which
20 provides as follows:

21 A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE
22 CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO
23 EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE
24 RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE
25 MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE
26 DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

1 5.3 Paladone waives any and all claims against Plaintiffs, their attorneys and other
2 representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made (or those that could have been
3 taken or made) by Plaintiffs and their attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of
4 investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,
5 and with respect to Covered Products.

6 5.4 Plaintiffs and anyone acting in concert with them or in privity with them, shall not
7 allege, file, issue, bring or support any future Proposition 65 action, notice of violation, or claim
8 concerning alleged lead exposure from the Covered Products, whether existing now or in the future,
9 if such products have been shown through testing to meet the Reformulation Standard in § 3.2.

10 **6. INTEGRATION**

11 6.1 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and
12 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been
13 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist
14 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

15 **7. NOTICES**

16 7.1 Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided
17 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i)
18 electronic mail; (ii) first-class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (iii)
19 overnight courier on any party by the other party at the following addresses:

20 For Defendant:

21 Greg Sperla
22 DLA Piper LLP (US)
23 555 Mission St., Ste. 2400
24 San Francisco, CA 94105
25 greg.sperla@us.dlapiper.com

26 And

27 For Plaintiffs:

28 Evan Smith
29 Brodsky Smith
30 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300
31 Beverly Hills, CA 90212

1 esmith@brodskysmith.com

2 Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to
3 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

4 **8. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

5 8.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile, each of
6 which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and
7 the same document.

8 **9. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**
9 **APPROVAL**

10 9.1 Plaintiffs agree to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &
11 Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.
12 Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

13 9.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the
14 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the
15 Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30
16 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

17 9.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an
18 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent
19 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on
20 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

21 **10. MODIFICATION**

22 10.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties
23 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.
24
25
26
27
28

1 **11. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

2 11.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent
3 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

4 11.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions
5 pursuant to law.

6 **12. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

7 12.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter to implement or modify the
8 Consent Judgment.

9 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

10 13.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their
11 respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this
12 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute
13 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as
14 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

15 **14. ENFORCEMENT PROCEDURES**

16 14.1 Plaintiff and persons working in concert with them or in privity with them shall
17 provide written notice to Paladone at least 30 days before initiating, filing, or prosecuting any claim,
18 action, or notice of violation arising out of this Consent Judgment or Proposition 65 with respect to
19 exposures to lead from Covered Products after the Effective Date ("Post-Judgment NOV"). The
20 Post-Judgment NOV shall include: (a) a declaration that the specific Covered Product alleged to be
21 in violation of the Consent Judgment or Proposition 65 was purchased in California and tested in
22 excess of the Reformulation Standard, when tested in accordance with § 3.2, within three months
23 of the Notice of Breach and that no warning was provided for the specific Covered Product; (b) any
24 and all test results that support the allegation that the Covered Product violates this Consent
25 Judgment; (c) copies of (i) relevant purchase information for the allegedly violating Covered
26 Product; (ii) images of the packaging or labeling of the allegedly violating Covered Product
27 showing the SKU, UPC, Lot, and/or Batch number(s), if any; and (iii) all other test results
28

1 conducted on the same Covered Product performed within three months of the Post-Judgment
2 NOV. Upon receipt of a Post-Judgment NOV, Paladone and Plaintiff shall meet and confer for not
3 less than thirty days in an effort to resolve the alleged violation informally. During this time,
4 Plaintiff and persons working in concert with them or in privity with them shall not file any motion,
5 application, action, or pleading regarding the violation(s) alleged in the Post-Judgment NOV. If,
6 within 30 days of receipt of a Post-Judgment NOV, Paladone provides a test report that (a) is for
7 the product subject to or otherwise identified in the Post-Judgment NOV and (b) demonstrates
8 compliance with the standards set forth in § 3.2 of this Consent Judgment by indicating a wipe test
9 result no higher than 1 microgram (μg) of lead when analyzed pursuant to NIOSH method no. 9100
10 by ISO/IEC 17025-accredited laboratory, then no action, motion, or other proceeding based on the
11 allegations at issue in the Post-Judgment NOV shall be filed, initiated, or prosecuted and Paladone
12 shall have no liability to Plaintiff or any person asserting such claim, action, or motion. Covered
13 Products that have been tested by an ISO/IEC 17025-accredited laboratory using NIOSH Method
14 No. 9100 and found to produce wipe test results ≤ 1 μg of lead shall be deemed compliant with this
15 Consent Judgment and with Proposition 65, and such test results shall constitute compliance with
16 this Consent Judgment and shall be deemed, and are, a complete defense to any claim, action, or
17 allegation of violation of Proposition 65 for exposure to lead in Covered Products brought by
18 Plaintiffs or persons in privity with them.

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

15. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES

In the event of a dispute with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment, after the Effective Date, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, by telephone, or in writing to endeavor to resolve the dispute outside of the court. No motion, application, action, or pleading may be filed absent such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand, including an opportunity to exchange any evidence, such as testing results, that demonstrate compliance according to the procedures set forth in § 14.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: _____

Date: 3rd Feb 2026

By: _____
PRECILA BALABBO

By: _____
PALADONE PRODUCTS INC.
JIM DOWNER - CEO

AGREED TO:

Date: _____

By: _____
EMA BELL

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

Dated: _____

Judge of Superior Court

1 **15. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES**

2 In the event of a dispute with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this
3 Consent Judgment, after the Effective Date, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, by
4 telephone, or in writing to endeavor to resolve the dispute outside of the court. No motion,
5 application, action, or pleading may be filed absent such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute
6 beforehand, including an opportunity to exchange any evidence, such as testing results, that
7 demonstrate compliance according to the procedures set forth in § 14.

8 **AGREED TO:**

AGREED TO:

9
10 Date: 3 | 10 | 26

Date: _____

11 By: 
12 **PRECILA BALABBO**

By: _____
PALADONE PRODUCTS INC.

13
14
15 **AGREED TO:**

16 Date: _____

17
18 By: _____
EMA BELL

19
20
21 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

22
23 Dated: _____

Judge of Superior Court

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

15. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES

In the event of a dispute with respect to either Party's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment, after the Effective Date, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, by telephone, or in writing to endeavor to resolve the dispute outside of the court. No motion, application, action, or pleading may be filed absent such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand, including an opportunity to exchange any evidence, such as testing results, that demonstrate compliance according to the procedures set forth in § 14.

AGREED TO:

AGREED TO:

Date: _____

Date: _____

By: _____
PRECILA BALABBO

By: _____
PALADONE PRODUCTS INC.

AGREED TO:

Date: 3 / 10 / 20

By: 
EMMA BELL

IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

Dated: _____

Judge of Superior Court