

## **SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

### **1. INTRODUCTION**

#### **1.1 Parties**

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. (“EHA”), on the one hand, and Resourceful Marketing, LLC (“RM”), on the other hand, with EHA and RM each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as the “Parties.” EHA is a corporation in the State of California serving in the interest of the general public by seeking to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. EHA alleges that RM is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”). RM denies EHA’s allegations that it is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65 and alleges that at all times relevant to EHA’s allegations through the present, RM has at all times employed fewer than 10 employees. *See* California Health and Safety Code § 25249.11(b).

#### **1.2 General Allegations**

EHA alleges that RM manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California, serum products that contain diethanolamine (“DEA”) and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. DEA is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer. RM disputes these allegations and maintains that it is exempt from Proposition 65.

#### **1.3 Product Description**

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are defined as, and expressly limited to Vibrance Super C Penetrating Serum (“Covered Products”), that are manufactured, sold and/or distributed for sale in California by RM.

#### **1.4 Notice of Violation**

On or around September 19, 2024, EHA served RM, Target Corporation, the California Attorney General, and certain other public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation

of Proposition 65 (“Notice”). The Notice alleged that RM and Target Corporation had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to DEA contained in Covered Products.

To the best of the parties’ knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

### **1.5 No Admission**

RM denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and maintains that all of the products it sold and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws, and that it is otherwise exempt from Proposition 65. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by RM of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by RM of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by RM. For the avoidance of doubt, RM denies that it is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, and alleges that at all times relevant to the allegations in the Notice through the present, RM has employed fewer than 10 employees. *See* California Health and Safety Code § 25249.11(b). This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect RM's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

### **1.6 Effective Date**

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term “Effective Date” shall mean the date this Settlement Agreement is executed by the Parties.

## **2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

### **2.1 Reformulation Standard**


Although RM alleges that it is not a person in the course doing business for purposes of Proposition 65 (California Health and Safety Code § 25249.11(b)), RM represents to EHA that beginning 30 days after the Effective Date, Covered Products that RM directly manufactures, distributes, or sells in the State of California will be reformulated to eliminate residual DEA (“Reformulated Product”) and will have a DEA content less than the Reporting Limit of 10 mg/kg

when analyzed pursuant to liquid chromatography/tandem mass spectrometry (LC/MS/MS), inductively coupled mass-spectroscopy (ICP-MS) or other method of analysis utilized by the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) for qualitative and quantitative screening of cosmetics and cosmetic raw materials (“Reformulation Standard”). The warning requirement set forth in paragraph 2.2 below shall not apply to any Reformulated Product.


## 2.2 General Warning Requirements

Commencing 30 days after the Effective Date, RM agrees any Covered Product (that does not meet the Reformulation Standard) distributed for sale in California, shall contain a “clear and reasonable” Proposition 65 warning, within the meaning of Section 25249.6 of the Act. RM agrees that each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be seen, read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Covered Products the warning applies, and which listed chemical(s) is/are implicated, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Products that do not meet the Reformulation Standard shall consist of a product-specific warning directly affixed to the product’s label or tag; Specifically, pursuant to § 25603(a) – (d), one of the following statements must be utilized:


- 1)  **WARNING:** “WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:” This product can expose you to chemicals including Diethanolamine (“DEA”), which is known to the State of California to cause cancer. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

OR


- 2)  **WARNING:**” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:” Cancer risk from exposure to Diethanolamine (“DEA”). See [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

**SHORT FORM**

OR

**SHORT FORM**      3)  **“WARNING:”** [or] **“CA WARNING:”** [or] **“CALIFORNIA WARNING:”** Can expose you to Diethanolamine (“DEA”), a carcinogen. See [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

OR

**SHORT FORM ON  
A PRODUCT  
MANUFACTURED/  
LABELED PRIOR  
TO 1/1/28,  
REGARDLESS OF  
DATE OF SALE**      4)  **WARNING:** Cancer – [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

The triangle above shall be yellow on the warning statement. Where label for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the warning text, in a size no smaller than the height of the word, “WARNING”. A short-form warning must be provided on a product in a type size that complies with Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25601(c). In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Products’ packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. Where a labeling, or label as defined in Section 256001.1 is used to provide a warning that includes consumer information about a product in a language other than English, the warning must also be provided in that language in addition to English.

As set forth in Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25602(b), to the extent Covered Products that do not meet the Reformulation Standard are sold online, a warning that complies with the content requirements of Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603 must be provided via of the following methods: (1) A warning on the product display page; (2) A clearly marked hyperlink using the word “**WARNING**” or the words “**CA WARNING**” or “**CALIFORNIA WARNING**” on the product display page that links to the warning; or (3) An otherwise prominently displayed warning provided to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. If a warning is provided using the short-form label content pursuant to Section 25602(a)(4), the warning provided on the website may use the same content. For purposes of this section, a warning is not prominently displayed if the purchaser must search for it in the general

content of the website. For internet purchases made prior to 1/1/28, a retail seller is not responsible under Section 25600.2(e)(4) for conspicuously posting or displaying the new warning online until 60 calendar days after the retailer receives a warning or a written notice under Section 25600.2(b) and (c) which updates a short-form warning compliant with Section 25603(c) with content compliant with Section 25603(b). RM shall instruct any third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered Products that do not meet the Reformulation Standard to include the same online warning, as set forth above, as a condition of selling the Covered Products in California.

For the avoidance of doubt, there shall be no obligation for RM, or any third party seller, to provide a warning for and Reformulated Product or Covered Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to the 30 days after Effective Date, and the Section 4 release applies to all such Covered Products.

(i) Changes in Warning Regulations or Statutes

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting Proposition 65 warning text and/or methods of transmission applicable to the Covered Products and the chemical at issue, which are different than those set forth above, RM shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement. If regulations or legislation are enacted providing that Proposition 65 warnings as to DEA in this product are no longer required, a lack of warning by RM will not thereafter be a breach of this Agreement.

**2.3 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Covered Products**

The injunctive requirements of Section 2 shall not apply to Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as of the 30 days after Effective Date, which Covered Products are expressly subject to the releases provided in Section 4.1. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products in the stream of commerce specifically include, but are not limited to, Covered Products in the process of manufacture.

### **3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS**

#### **3.1 Civil Penalty Payment**

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all claims alleged in the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement, RM agrees to pay two thousand six hundred (\$2,600.00) in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount retained by EHA. Shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” and (b) Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. as follows:

- One payment of \$1,950.00 to OEHHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$650.00 to EHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010  
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

All penalty payments owed to EHA shall be sent to:

Isaac Fayman  
Environmental Health Advocates  
225 Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101

### **3.2 Attorney Fees and Costs**

The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to EHA and its counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, RM agrees to pay twenty-three thousand four hundred dollars (\$23,400.00) to EHA and its counsel for all fees and costs incurred in investigating, bringing this matter the attention of RM, and negotiating a settlement. The twenty-three thousand four hundred dollars (\$23,400.00) in Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be payable to Entorno Law, LLP as one payment of \$23,400.00, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments required under this Section shall be delivered to:

Noam Glick  
Entorno Law, LLP  
225 Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101

### **3.3 Tax Documentation**

RM agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and EHA agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the payees under this Settlement Agreement. The Parties acknowledge that RM cannot issue any settlement payments pursuant to Section 3.1 and 3.2 above until after RM receives the requisite W-9 forms from EHA's counsel.

## **4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED**

### **4.1 EHA's Release of RM**

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution of all claims between EHA, on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, and RM for all claims that can or could have been asserted by EHA, on its own behalf, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees, against RM and each of its respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, attorneys, and any entity, including, but not limited to each entity to whom RM directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers,

retailers (including but not limited to Target Corporation), franchisees, cooperative members and licensees, and each of their respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, and employees (“Releasees”), each of whom is a third party beneficiary of this release, based on the failure to warn about exposures to DEA required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, sold or distributed for sale in California by RM before 30 days after the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice, or for any other reason.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, EHA on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees hereby waives any and all rights it may have to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims against RM and Releasees including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees and attorney fees arising under Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to DEA required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by RM, before 30 days after the Effective Date.

#### **4.2 RM's Release of EHA**

RM, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Products.

#### **4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542**

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. EHA on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and RM on behalf of itself only, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the



Effective Date. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

**A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.**

EHA and RM each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

**5. PUBLIC BENEFIT**

It is Parties' understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by RM under this Settlement Agreement confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Parties that to the extent any other private party serves a notice and/or initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to RM's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning actual or alleged exposure to DEA prior to use of the Covered Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that RM is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

**6. SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

**7. GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

**8. ENFORCEMENT**

In any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

**9. NOTICE**

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For RM:

Tyler R. Dowdall  
Tarter Krinsky & Drogin LLP  
2029 Century Park East, Suite 400N  
Los Angeles, CA 90067  
tdowdall@tarterkrinsky.com

For EHA:

Noam Glick  
Entorno Law, LLP  
225 Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

EHA and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

**12. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

**13. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: 04/23/2025

Date: 03-04-25

By:   
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH  
ADVOCATES, INC.

By: Michael Sampson  
RESOURCEFUL MARKETING, LLC