

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

### 1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 **The Parties.** This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Precila Balabbo ("Balabbo") and Godinger Silver Art Ltd. ("Godinger"). Together, Balabbo and Godinger are collectively referred to as the "Parties." Balabbo is an individual who resides in the State of California, and seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Balabbo alleges that Godinger is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq. ("Proposition 65").

1.2 **General Allegations.** Balabbo alleges that Godinger has exposed individuals to lead from its sales of Jill Zarin Home flamingo serving trays, UPC # 028199144459 without first providing users and consumers of the product with a clear and reasonable health hazard exposure warning as required pursuant to Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm.

1.3 **Product Description.** The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are Jill Zarin Home flamingo serving trays, UPC # 028199144459 (the "Products") that have been imported, distributed, offered for sale and/or sold in California by Godinger and its downstream distributors, seller, and/or retailers, etc.

1.4 **Notice of Violation.** On September 26, 2024, Balabbo served The TJX Companies, Inc., Marshalls of CA, LLC (collectively, "TJX"), Godinger, and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, et seq." (the "Notice"). The Notice provided Godinger and such others, including public enforcers, with notice that alleged that Godinger was in violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6, for failing to warn California consumers and customers that use of the Products will expose them to lead. No public enforcer has diligently prosecuted the allegations set forth in the Notice.

**1.5 No Admission.** Godinger denies the material factual and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are or have been sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been and are in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Godinger of any fact, finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Godinger of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Godinger. However, this § 1.5 shall not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Godinger maintains that it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.

**1.6 Effective Date.** For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Agreement is last executed by the Parties.

**2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS**

**2.1 Reformulation of Products.** Commencing within sixty (60) days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Products that Godinger directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either be: (a) reformulated Products pursuant to § 2.2, below; or (b) labeled with a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to §§ 2.3 - 2.4, below. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a "Reformulated Product" is a Product that is in compliance with the standard set forth in § 2.2, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 2.3 - 2.4 shall not apply to any Reformulated Product.

**2.2 Reformulation Standard.** "Reformulated Products" shall mean Products that produce a wipe test result no higher than 1 microgram ( $\mu\text{g}$ ) of lead when analyzed pursuant to NIOSH method no. 9100.

**2.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning.** Commencing within 60 days after the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 2.3 and 2.4 must be provided for all Products that Godinger manufacturers, imports, distributes, sells, or

offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated Product. There shall be no obligation for Godinger to provide an exposure warning for Products that entered the stream of commerce within 60 days after the Effective Date. The warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described in §§ 2.3(a) or (b), respectively:

(a) **Warning.** The “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

**⚠ WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

(b) **Alternative Warning:** Godinger may, but is not required to, use the alternative short-form warning<sup>1</sup> as set forth in this § 2.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

**⚠ WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

**2.4 A Warning or Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 2.3 must print the word “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Products does not use the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** shall be affixed to or printed on the Products’ packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or electronic device or automatic process only if such electronic device or automatic process provides the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** without the purchaser having to seek it out, provided that the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** may be contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Product and shall be at least the same size as those other safety warnings. If “consumer information,” as that term is defined in Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.1(c) as it may be amended from time to time, is provided in a foreign language, Godinger shall

---

<sup>1</sup> An **Alternative Warning** on a Product manufactured and labeled after January 1, 2028 shall be provided in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, § 25603(b).

provide the **Warning or Alternative Warning** in the foreign language in accordance with applicable warning regulations adopted by the State of California's Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA").

In addition to affixing the **Warning or Alternative Warning** to the Product's packaging or labeling, the **Warning or Alternative Warning** shall be posted on websites where Godinger offers Products for sale to consumers in California. The requirements of this Section shall be satisfied if the **Warning or Alternative Warning**, or a clearly marked hyperlink using the word "**WARNING**," appears on the product display page, or by otherwise prominently displaying the warning to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. To comply with this Section, Godinger shall (a) post the **Warning or Alternative Warning** on its own website and, if it has the ability to do so, on the websites of its third-party internet sellers; and (b) if it does not have the ability to post the **Warning or Alternative Warning** on the websites of its third-party internet sellers, provide such sellers with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Product that have been provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.2 are not released in Section 5 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning requirements of this Section.

**2.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** The Parties agree that Godinger shall be deemed to be in compliance with this Settlement Agreement by either adhering to § 2 of this Settlement Agreement or by complying with warning regulations adopted by the State of California's OEHHA applicable to the Product and the exposure at issue.

**3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)**

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Godinger shall pay \$500.00 as a Civil Penalty in accordance with this Section. The Civil Penalty payment shall be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with 75% of the Penalty remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25% of the Penalty remitted to Balabbo. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below

**3.1 Civil Penalty.** Within fifteen (15) business days of the Effective Date, Godinger shall issue two (2) separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$375.00; and to (b) "Precila Balabbo" in the amount of \$125.00. The Civil Penalty payment(s) shall be delivered to the addresses identified in § 3.2, below.

**3.2 Payment Procedures.**

**(a) Issuance of Payments.** Payments shall be delivered as follows:

(i) All payments owed to Balabbo, pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered to the following payment address:

Evan J. Smith, Esquire  
Brodsky Smith  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

(ii) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to § 3.1 shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
P.O. Box 4010  
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics  
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
1001 I Street  
Sacramento, CA 95814

**(b) Copy of Payments to OEHHA.** Godinger agrees to provide Balabbo's counsel with a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payments to Balabbo, to be delivered to the address provided in § 3.2(a)(i), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

(c) **Tax Documentation.** Godinger agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and Balabbo agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the following payees under this Settlement Agreement:

(i) "Precila Balabbo" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided within five (5) days after this Settlement Agreement is fully executed by the Parties;

(ii) "Brodsky Smith" (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in Section 3.2(a)(i); and

(iii) "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

4. **REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS**

The Parties acknowledge that Balabbo and her counsel offered to reach preliminary agreement on the material terms of this dispute before reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them. The Parties thereafter reached an accord on the compensation due to Balabbo and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Under these legal principles, Godinger shall reimburse Balabbo's counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to the attention of Godinger, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Within fifteen (15) business days of the Effective Date, Godinger shall issue a check payable to "Brodsky Smith" in the amount of \$4,500.00 for delivery to the address identified in § 3.2(a)(i), above.

5. **RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

**5.1 Release of Godinger, Upstream Suppliers, and Downstream Sellers and Entities.** This Settlement Agreement is a full, final and binding resolution between Balabbo, acting on her own behalf and on behalf of the public interest, and Godinger, of all claims that could have been asserted by Balabbo or on behalf of her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assigns ("Releasers") for failure to provide warnings for alleged exposures to

chemicals from use of the Products, and Releasors hereby release all claims against Godinger and its parents, shareholders, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives, agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates, and their predecessors, successors and assigns, marketplaces, and all entities from whom they obtain and to whom they directly or indirectly distribute or sell Products, including but not limited to manufacturers, suppliers, distributors, wholesalers, customers, licensors, licensees, sellers, retailers, including but not limited to, Gally Enterprises, LLC; TJX Companies, Inc., TJX Companies, Inc. dba Marshalls; Marshalls of CA, LLC., and each of their parents, subsidiaries, affiliates and parents, franchisees and cooperative members and licensees (collectively, the "Releasees"), within 60 days after the Effective Date..

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, and for the payments to be made pursuant to §§ 3 and 4 above, Balabbo, on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby covenants not to sue and waives any right to institute, participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that she may have, including without limitation, all actions and causes of action in law and in equity, all obligations, expenses (including without limitation all attorneys' fees, expert fees, and investigation fees, and costs), damages, losses, liabilities and demands against any of the Releasees of any nature, character, or kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, limited to and arising out of the alleged or actual exposure to lead from use of the Products.

**5.2 Godinger's Release of Balabbo.** Godinger, on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Balabbo, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Balabbo and/or her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter or with respect to exposure to lead from the Products.

**5.3 California Civil Code § 1542.** It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Products will develop or be discovered.

Balabbo on behalf of herself only, on one hand, and Godinger, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through 60 days after the Effective Date, including all rights of action therefor. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in §§ 5.1 and 5.2, above, may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HER OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HER OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Balabbo and Godinger each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

**5.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65.** The Parties agree that compliance by Godinger with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance by Godinger with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to lead from use of the Products.

**5.5. Public Benefit.** It is Godinger's understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Godinger under this Settlement Agreement, would confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Godinger that to the extent any other private party initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Godinger's failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to lead prior to use of the Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Godinger is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

**5.6 Res Judicata.** It is intended that the settlement agreement shall act as a full and final bar to any and all claims pursuant to Proposition 65 against Godinger and/or Releasees with respect to the



Products under the doctrines of *res judicata* and collateral estoppel and any other applicable doctrine, statute, or law.

**6. ENFORCEMENT OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

**6.1** A Party may enforce any of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement only for Product that Godinger and/or Releasees directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California 60 days after the Effective Date that Balabbo or his representatives has tested and certified that the Product does not comply with Reformulation and/or Warnings pursuant to Section 2 of this Settlement Agreement only after that Party first provides sixty (60) days written notice to the Party allegedly failing to comply with the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement and attempts to resolve such Party's failure to comply in an open and good faith manner without the alleged non-complying Party having to pay any settlement amount.

**6.2 Notice of Violation.** Prior to bringing any proceeding to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement only for Product that Godinger and/or Releasees directly manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California 60 days after the Effective Date that Balabbo or his representatives has tested and certified that the Product does not comply with Reformulation and/or Warnings pursuant to Section 2 of this Settlement Agreement, Balabbo shall provide a written notice of violation ("NOV") to Godinger that includes information sufficient for them to be able to understand and correct the violation without payment of any settlement amount or monetary payment, including but not limited to: (a) the name of the product, (b) specific dates when the product was sold in California, (c) the store, website, or other place at which the product was available for sale to California consumers, and (d) any other evidence or other support for the allegations in the NOV, including all test data obtained by Balabbo regarding the Product.

**6.3** Within thirty (30) days of receiving an NOV, Godinger shall notify Balabbo/his representative of the following: (a) **whether** the Product was shipped by Godinger for sale in California before 60 days after the Effective Date, or (b) since receiving the NOV, Godinger has taken corrective action by either taking all steps necessary to bring the sale of the Product into compliance under the terms of this Settlement Agreement, or requested that its customers in California remove

the Products identified in the NOV from sale in California and destroy or return the Products to Godinger.

Upon receiving such notification from Godinger, Balabbo shall take no further action regarding the alleged violation against Godinger including, without limitation, requiring a monetary payment.

7. **SEVERABILITY**

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the Settlement Agreement being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Settlement Agreement.

8. **GOVERNING LAW**

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the law of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

9. **NOTICES**

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-class (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight or two-day courier on any party by the other party to the following addresses:

For Godinger:

Cathleen S. Huang  
Bowles & Verna, LLP  
2121 N. California Blvd., Ste. 875  
Walnut Creek, CA 94596

For Balabbo:

Evan J. Smith  
Brodsky Smith  
Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

Either party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

**10. COUNTERPARTS: SIGNATURES**

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

**11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)**

Balabbo agrees to comply with the reporting requirements referenced in Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

**12. MODIFICATION**

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by a written agreement of the Parties.

**13. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

This Settlement Agreement contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

**14. AUTHORIZATION**

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement and have read, understood and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained of this Settlement Agreement.


**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: 5/22/25

Date: 5/14/25

By:   
Precila Balabbo

By:   
Godinger Silver Art Ltd.