

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. (“EHA”), on the one hand, and Mashburn, LLC (“Mashburn”), on the other hand, with EHA and Mashburn each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as the “Parties.” EHA is a corporation in the State of California serving in the interest of the general public by seeking to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. EHA alleges that Mashburn is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations

EHA alleges that Mashburn manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California, shoe horns products that contain lead and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer, developmental toxicity, and reproductive toxicity.

1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are defined as, and expressly limited to Small Classic Shoe Horn- Sid Mashburn (“Covered Products”), that are manufactured, sold and/or distributed for sale in California by Mashburn.

1.4 Notice of Violation

On or around March 18, 2024, EHA served Mashburn, the California Attorney General, and certain other public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 (“Notice”). The Notice was subsequently amended to identify an additional address for Mashburn on October 24, 2024. The Notice alleged that Mashburn had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead contained in Covered Products.

To the best of the parties’ knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise

prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

1.5 No Admission

Mashburn denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and maintains that all of the products it sold and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Mashburn of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Mashburn of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Mashburn. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Mashburn's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Settlement Agreement is executed by the Parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Compliance Generally

Beginning on or before the Effective Date, Mashburn, at its sole discretion, agrees to either (a) cease selling, offering for sale, or distributing the Covered Products in California (subject to the limitations discussed in Section 2.4); (b) offer for sale or distribute in California Covered Products pursuant to Section 2.2; or (c) provide a clear and reasonable Proposition 65 warning pursuant to Section 2.3 below.

2.2 Reformulation Standard

Commencing on the Effective Date, Mashburn shall not sell or distribute for sale in California any Covered Product unless it produces a wipe test result no higher than 1 microgram of lead when analyzed pursuant to NIOSH method no. 9100 ("Reformulation Standard").


In the event the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment at any time adopts a safe harbor level for Lead that is different than the Reformulation Standard in this Agreement, Mashburn shall be permitted to use the safe harbor level without further notice to EHA. Moreover, should EHA reach a settlement with another manufacturer, distributor or reseller alleging a violation of Proposition

65 with respect to Lead, Mashburn may comply with the Reformulation Standard in that settlement and will be deemed in compliance with Proposition 65.

2.3 General Warning Requirements


Commencing on the Effective Date, Mashburn agrees any Covered Product sold in California, shall contain a “clear and reasonable” Proposition 65 warning, within the meaning of Section 25249.6 of the Act. Mashburn agrees that each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be seen, read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which *specific* Covered Products the warning applies, and which listed chemical(s) is/are implicated, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Products shall consist of a product-specific warning via one or more of the following methods: (1) A posted sign, shelf tag, or shelf sign for the consumer product at each point of display of the product; (2) Any electronic device or process that automatically provides the warning to the purchaser (not applicable to internet purchases, which are subject to the provisions of § 25602(b)); (3) A warning directly affixed to the product’s label or tag; or (4) A short-form warning on the label that complies with the content requirements set forth in §§ 25603(b) and 25603(a). Specifically, pursuant to § 25603(a) – (d), one of the following statements must be utilized:

- 1)  “WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:” This product can expose you to lead, which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.


OR

SHORT FORM

- 2)  “WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING: Risk of cancer and reproductive harm from exposure to lead. See www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.


OR

SHORT FORM

- 3)  **WARNING:**” [or] “**CA WARNING:**” [or]
“**CALIFORNIA WARNING:** Can expose you to lead, a
carcinogen and reproductive toxicant. See
www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

OR

**SHORT FORM ON
A PRODUCT
MANUFACTURED/
LABELED PRIOR
TO 1/1/28,
REGARDLESS OF
DATE OF SALE**

- 4)  **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive
Harm—www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.

The triangle above shall be yellow on the warning statement. Where the sign, label, or shelf tag for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the warning text, in a size no smaller than the height of the word, “WARNING.” A short-form warning must be provided on a product in a type size that complies with Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25601(c). In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Products’ packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. Where a sign, labeling, or label as defined in Section 256001.1 is used to provide a warning that includes consumer information about a product in a language other than English, the warning must also be provided in that language in addition to English.

As set forth in Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25602(b), to the extent Covered Products are sold online, a warning that complies with the content requirements of Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603 must be provided via of the following methods: (1) A warning on the product display page; (2) A clearly marked hyperlink using the word “WARNING” or the words “CA WARNING” or “CALIFORNIA WARNING” on the product display page that links to the warning; or (3) An otherwise prominently displayed warning provided to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. If a warning is provided using the short-form label content pursuant to Section 25602(a)(4), the warning provided on the website may use the same content. For purposes of this section, a warning is not prominently displayed if the purchaser must search for it in the general content of the website. For internet purchases made prior to 1/1/28, a retail seller is not responsible under Section 25600.2(e)(4) for conspicuously posting

or displaying the new warning online until 60 calendar days after the retailer receives a warning or a written notice under Section 25600.2(b) and (c) which updates a short-form warning compliant with Section 25603(c) with content compliant with Section 25603(b). These requirements extend to any websites under the exclusive control of Mashburn where Covered Products are sold into California. In addition, Mashburn shall instruct any third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered Products to include the same online warning, as set forth above, as a condition of selling the Covered Products in California.

There shall be no obligation for Mashburn to provide a warning for Covered Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date, and the Section 4 release applies to all such Covered Products.

(i) Changes in Warning Regulations or Statutes

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting Proposition 65 warning text and/or methods of transmission applicable to the Covered Products and the chemical at issue, which are different than those set forth above, Mashburn shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement. If regulations or legislation are enacted providing that Proposition 65 warnings as to lead in this product are no longer required, a lack of warning by Mashburn will not thereafter be a breach of this Agreement.

2.4 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Covered Products

The injunctive requirements of Section 2 shall not apply to Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date, which Covered Products are expressly subject to the releases provided in Section 4.1. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products in the stream of commerce specifically include, but are not limited to, Covered Products in the process of manufacture.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all claims alleged in the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Mashburn agrees to pay two thousand (\$2,000.00) in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California

Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount retained by EHA. Mashburn shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) "OEHHA" and (b) Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. as follows:

- One payment of \$1,500.00 to OEHHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$500.00 to EHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

All penalty payments owed to EHA shall be sent to:

Isaac Fayman
Environmental Health Advocates
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.2 Attorney Fees and Costs

The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to EHA and its counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, Mashburn agrees to pay eighteen thousand dollars (\$18,000.00) to EHA and its counsel for all fees and costs incurred in investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Mashburn, and negotiating a settlement. The eighteen thousand dollars (\$18,000.00) in Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be

payable to Entorno Law, LLP as one payment of \$18,000.00, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments required under this Section shall be delivered to:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.3 Tax Documentation

Mashburn agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and EHA agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the payees under this Settlement Agreement. The Parties acknowledge that Mashburn cannot issue any settlement payments pursuant to Section 3.1 and 3.2 above until after Mashburn receives the requisite W-9 forms from EHA's counsel.

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 EHA's Release of Mashburn

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution of all claims between EHA, on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, and Mashburn for all claims that can or could have been asserted by EHA, on its own behalf, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees, against (i) Mashburn and each of its respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, attorneys, (ii) each upstream entity from whom the Covered Products was purchased by Mashburn, and each of their respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, and attorneys, and (iii) each entity, including, but not limited to each entity to whom Mashburn directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members and licensees ("Releasees"), based on the failure to warn about exposures to lead required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, sold or distributed for sale in California by Mashburn before the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice, or for any other reason.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, EHA on its own

behalf and not on behalf of the public, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees hereby waives any and all rights it may have to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims against Mashburn and Releasees including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees and attorney fees arising under Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to lead required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by Mashburn, before the Effective Date.

4.2 Mashburn's Release of EHA

Mashburn, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Products.

4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. EHA on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Mashburn on behalf of itself only, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims and nevertheless waive California Civil Code section 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code section 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

EHA and Mashburn each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

5. PUBLIC BENEFIT

It is Mashburn's understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Mashburn under this Settlement Agreement confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Mashburn that to the extent any other private party serves a notice and/or initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Mashburn's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning actual or alleged exposure to lead prior to use of the Covered Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Mashburn is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be adversely affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

8. ENFORCEMENT

In any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

9. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For Mashburn:

Brandon A. Prince
Nelson Mullins Riley & Scarborough LLP
19191 S. Vermont Ave., Suite 900
Torrance, CA 90502
brandon.prince@nelsonmullins.com

For EHA:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

EHA and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

12. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

13. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

Date: 3/17/25

By: 
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
ADVOCATES, INC.

AGREED TO:

Date: 3/3/25

By: 
MASHBURN, LLC