

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. (“EHA”), on the one hand, and Biedermann & Sons Distribution LLC (“Biedermann”), on the other hand, with EHA and Biedermann each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively as the “Parties.” EHA is a corporation in the State of California serving in the interest of the general public by seeking to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances used in consumer products. EHA alleges that Biedermann is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health and Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* (“Proposition 65”).

1.2 General Allegations

EHA alleges that Biedermann manufactures, sells, and/or distributes for sale in California, candle snuffer products that contain lead and that it does so without first providing the health hazard warning required by Proposition 65. Lead is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause cancer, developmental toxicity, and reproductive toxicity.

1.3 Product Description

The products covered by this Settlement Agreement are defined as, and expressly limited to the Satin Brass Candle Snuffers (“Covered Products”), that are manufactured, sold and/or distributed for sale in California by Biedermann.

1.4 Notice of Violation

On or around February 21, 2025, EHA served Biedermann, the California Attorney General, and certain other public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation (“NOV”) of Proposition 65, which followed a January 18, 2024 60-Day NOV to General Wax Co., Inc. (the February 21, 2025 NOV and the January 18, 2024 NOV are collectively referred to herein as “Notice”). The Notice alleged that Biedermann had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to lead contained in

Covered Products.

To the best of the parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the violations alleged in the Notice.

1.5 No Admission

Biedermann denies the material, factual, and legal allegations in the Notice and maintains that all of the products it sold and/or distributed for sale in California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Biedermann of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Biedermann of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Biedermann. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Biedermann's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notice, Biedermann maintains that it is not a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition 65, and it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, the Covered Products for sale in California in violation of Proposition 65.

1.6 Effective Date


For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean the date this Settlement Agreement is executed by all the Parties.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 General Warning Requirements

Commencing on the Effective Date, Biedermann agrees that any Covered Product sold in California, shall contain a "clear and reasonable" Proposition 65 warning, within the meaning of Section 25249.6 of the Act. Biedermann agrees that each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be seen, read and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands the *specific* Covered Products to which the warning applies, and which listed chemical(s) is/are implicated, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Products shall consist of a product-specific warning via one or more of the following methods: (1) A posted sign, shelf tag, or shelf sign for the consumer product at each point of display of the product; (2) Any electronic device or process that automatically provides the warning to the purchaser (not applicable to internet purchases, which are subject to the provisions of Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25602(b)); (3) A warning directly affixed to the product's label or tag; or (4) A short-form warning on the label that complies with the content requirements set forth in Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, §§ 25603(a) and 25603(b). Specifically, pursuant to Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603(a)-(d), one of the following statements must be utilized:

- 1)  **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:”** This product can expose you to lead which is known to the State of California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.


OR

SHORT FORM

- 2)  **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING: Risk of cancer and reproductive harm from exposure to lead. See www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.**


OR

SHORT FORM

- 3)  **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING: Can expose you to lead, a carcinogen and reproductive toxicant. See www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.**

OR

**SHORT FORM ON
A PRODUCT
MANUFACTURED/
LABELED PRIOR
TO 1/1/28,
REGARDLESS OF
DATE OF SALE**

- 4)  **“WARNING: Cancer and Reproductive Harm—www.P65Warnings.ca.gov.**

The triangle above shall be yellow on the warning statement. Where the sign, label, or shelf tag for the product is not printed using the color yellow, the symbol may be printed in black and white. The symbol shall be placed to the left of the warning text, in a size no smaller than the height of the word, “WARNING.” A short-form warning must be provided on a product in a type size that complies with Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25601(c). In no case shall a warning statement displayed on the Covered Products’ packaging appear in a type size smaller than 6-point type. Where a sign, labeling, or label as defined in Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 256001.1 is used to provide a warning that includes consumer information about a product in a language other than English, the warning must also be provided in that language in addition to English.

As set forth in Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25602(b), to the extent Covered Products are sold online, a warning that complies with the content requirements of Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603 must be provided via of the following methods: (1) A warning on the product display page; (2) A clearly marked hyperlink using the word “WARNING” or the words “CA WARNING” or “CALIFORNIA WARNING” on the product display page that links to the warning; or (3) An otherwise prominently displayed warning provided to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. If a warning is provided using the short-form label content pursuant to Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25602(a)(4), the warning provided on the website may use the same content. For purposes of this section, a warning is not prominently displayed if the purchaser must search for it in the general content of the website. For internet purchases made prior to January 1, 2028, a retail seller is not responsible under Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25600.2(e)(4) for conspicuously posting or displaying the new warning online until 60 calendar days after the retailer receives a warning or a written notice under Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25600.2(b) and (c) which updates a short-form warning compliant with Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603(c) with content compliant with Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603(b). These requirements extend to any websites under the exclusive control of Biedermann where Covered Products are sold into California. In addition, Biedermann shall instruct any third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered Products to include the same online warning, as set forth above, as a condition of selling the Covered Products in California.

There shall be no obligation for Biedermann to provide a warning for Covered Products that entered the stream of commerce prior to the Effective Date, and the Section 4 release applies to all such Covered Products.

2.2 Changes in Warning Regulations or Statutes

In the event that the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment promulgates one or more regulations requiring or permitting Proposition 65 warning text and/or methods of transmission applicable to the Covered Products and the chemical at issue, which are different than those set forth above, Biedermann shall be entitled to use, at its discretion, such other warning text and/or method of transmission without being deemed in breach of this Agreement. If regulations or legislation are enacted providing that Proposition 65 warnings as to lead in this product are no longer required, a lack of warning by Biedermann will not thereafter be a breach of this Agreement.

2.4 Deemed Compliance with Proposition 65.

The Parties agree that compliance by Biedermann with this Settlement Agreement constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposure to lead from use of the Covered Products.

2.3 Grace Period for Existing Inventory of Covered Products

The injunctive requirements of Section 2 shall not apply to Covered Products that are already in the stream of commerce as of the Effective Date, which Covered Products are expressly subject to the releases provided in Section 4.1. For the avoidance of doubt, Covered Products in the stream of commerce specifically include, but are not limited to, Covered Products in the process of manufacture.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Civil Penalty Payment

Pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(b)(2), and in settlement of all claims alleged in the Notice or referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Biedermann agrees to pay two-thousand (\$2,000.00) in civil penalties. The penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health and Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the penalty amount paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”) and the remaining 25% of the penalty amount retained by EHA. Biedermann shall issue two separate checks for the initial civil penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” and (b) Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. as

follows:

- One payment of \$1,500.00 to OEHHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$500.00 to EHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

All penalty payments owed to EHA shall be sent to:

Isaac Fayman
Environmental Health Advocates
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.2 Attorney Fees and Costs

The Parties reached an accord on the compensation due to EHA and its counsel under the private attorney general doctrine and principles of contract law. Under these legal principles, Biedermann agrees to pay twenty-one thousand (\$21,000.00) to EHA and its counsel for all fees and costs incurred in investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Biedermann, and negotiating a settlement, inclusive of EHA's claims against General Wax Co., Inc., and all other work related to this matter. The twenty-one thousand (\$21,000.00) in Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be payable to Entorno Law, LLP as one payment of \$21,000.00 due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.

All payments required under this Section shall be delivered to:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

3.3 Tax Documentation

Biedermann agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its payments to, and EHA agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the payees under this Settlement Agreement. The Parties acknowledge that Biedermann cannot issue any settlement payments pursuant to Section 3.1 and 3.2 above until after Biedermann receives the requisite W-9 forms from EHA's counsel.

4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

4.1 EHA's Release of Biedermann

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final, and binding resolution of all claims between EHA, on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, and Biedermann for all claims that have been, can or could have been asserted by EHA, on its own behalf, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees, against Biedermann and each of its respective parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership, directors, officers, members, employees, attorneys, and any entity, including, but not limited to each entity to whom Biedermann directly or indirectly distributes or sells the Covered Products, including, but not limited to, its downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers (including but not limited to Biedermann & Sons Distribution LLC and General Wax Co., Inc.), franchisees, cooperative members and licensees ("Releasees"), based on the Notice and/or the failure to warn about exposures to lead required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, sold or distributed for sale in California by Biedermann before the Effective Date, as alleged in the Notice, or for any other reason.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, EHA on its own behalf and not on behalf of the public, on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors and assignees hereby waives any and all rights it may have to institute, maintain or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims against Biedermann and Releasees including, without limitation, all actions and causes of action, suits,

liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses including, but not exclusively, investigation fees, expert fees and attorney fees arising under the Notice and/or Proposition 65 with respect to the alleged or actual failure to warn about exposures to lead required under Proposition 65 in the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, sold or offered for sale by Biedermann, before the Effective Date.

4.2 Biedermann's Release of EHA

Biedermann, on its own behalf and on behalf of its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter, or with respect to the Covered Products.

4.3 California Civil Code Section 1542

It is possible that other claims not known to the Parties arising out of the facts alleged in the Notice and relating to the Covered Products will develop or be discovered. EHA on behalf of itself only, on one hand, and Biedermann on behalf of itself only, on the other hand, acknowledge that this Settlement Agreement is expressly intended to cover and include all such claims up through the Effective Date. The Parties acknowledge that the claims released in Sections 4.1 and 4.2 may include unknown claims, and nevertheless waive California Civil Code § 1542 as to any such unknown claims. California Civil Code § 1542 reads as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

EHA and Biedermann each acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver of California Civil Code § 1542.

5. PUBLIC BENEFIT

It is Biedermann's understanding that the commitments it has agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Biedermann under this Settlement Agreement confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5 and Cal. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Biedermann that to the extent any other private party serves a notice and/or initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Biedermann's alleged failure to provide a warning concerning actual or alleged exposure to lead prior to use of the Covered Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California, or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this Settlement Agreement, provided that Biedermann is in material compliance with this Settlement Agreement.

6. SEVERABILITY

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining enforceable provisions shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the Settlement Agreement being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Settlement Agreement.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California.

8. ENFORCEMENT

In any action to enforce the terms of this Settlement Agreement, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

9. NOTICE

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notice required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and sent by: (a) personal delivery; (b) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (c) a recognized overnight courier on any Party by the other at the following addresses:

For Biedermann:

Sarah P. Bell
John M. Ugai
Farella Braun + Martel LLP
One Bush Street, Suite 900
San Francisco, CA 94104
sbell@fbm.com
jugai@fbm.com

For EHA:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
San Diego, CA 92101

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (PDF) signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

11. COMPLIANCE WITH CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

EHA and its attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

12. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

13. AUTHORIZATION

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO:

Date: 5/5/2025

By: 
ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
ADVOCATES, INC.

AGREED TO:

3/25/2025
Date: _____

Mark Gannon
By: _____
BIEDERMANN & SONS DISTRIBUTION LLC

