

ENTORNO LAW, LLP

Craig M. Nicholas (SBN 178444)

Noam Glick (SBN 251582)

Jake W. Schulte (SBN 293777)

Janani Natarajan (SBN 346770)

Gianna E. Tirrell (SBN 358788)

225 Broadway, Suite 1900

San Diego, California 92101

Tel: (619) 629-0527

Email: craig@entornolaw.com

Email: noam@entornolaw.com

Email: jake@entornolaw.com

Email: janani@entornolaw.com

Email: gianna@entornolaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Environmental Health Advocates, Inc.

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
ADVOCATES, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

VALLEY FINE FOODS COMPANY,
LLC, a California limited liability company;
AMAZON.COM, INC., a Delaware
corporation; MRS. GOOCH'S NATURAL
FOOD MARKETS, INC., a California
corporation; COSTCO WHOLESALE
CORPORATION, a Washington corporation;
and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 25CV113093

**[PROPOSED] AMENDED CONSENT
JUDGMENT**

(Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 *et seq.* and
Code Civ. Proc. § 664.6)

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Parties

This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., (“EHA” or “Plaintiff”) and Valley Fine Foods Company, LLC (“Defendant” or “Valley Fine Foods”) with EHA and Valley Fine Foods each individually referred to as a “Party” and collectively referred to as the “Parties.”

1.2 Plaintiff

EHA is a corporation organized in the state of California, acting in the interest of the general public. It seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and to improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.

1.3 Defendant

Valley Fine Foods employs ten or more individuals and for purposes of this Consent Judgment only, is a “person in the course of doing business” for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 et seq. (“Proposition 65”).

1.4 General Allegations

EHA alleges that Valley Fine Foods manufactures, imports, sells, and distributes for sale Artisola Spinach & Cheese Ravioli and Pasta Prima Spinach & Mozzarella Ravioli that contain cadmium. EHA further alleges that Valley Fine Foods does so without providing a sufficient health hazard warning as required by Proposition 65 and related Regulations. Valley Fine Foods denies these allegations and asserts that its products are safe and in compliance with all applicable laws, rules and regulations.

1.5 Notice of Violation

On or around May 22, 2024, EHA served Defendant Valley Fine Foods, Amazon.com, Inc., Whole Foods Market California, Inc., the California Attorney General, and all other required public enforcement agencies with a 60-Day Notice of Violation of Proposition 65 (“Notice”). This Notice was subsequently amended on September 5, 2024, to add a second ravioli product and to add Costco Wholesale Corporation as a retailer. This Notice was subsequently amended on February 28, 2025, to correct the identity of Whole Foods Market California, Inc. to Mrs. Gooch’s Natural Food Markets,

1 Inc. The Notice alleged that Valley Fine Foods had violated Proposition 65 by failing to sufficiently
2 warn consumers in California of the health hazards associated with exposures to cadmium contained
3 in ravioli products, including but not limited to Artisola Spinach & Cheese Ravioli and Pasta Prima
4 Spinach & Mozzarella Ravioli manufactured or processed by Valley Fine Foods that allegedly contain
5 cadmium and are imported, sold, shipped, delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers in California
6 by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1).

7 No public enforcer has commenced or is otherwise prosecuting an action to enforce the
8 violations alleged in the Notice.

9 **1.6 Product Description**

10 The products covered by this Consent Judgment are ravioli products, including but not limited
11 to Artisola Spinach & Cheese Ravioli and Pasta Prima Spinach & Mozzarella Ravioli manufactured or
12 processed by Valley Fine Foods that allegedly contain cadmium and are imported, sold, shipped,
13 delivered, or distributed for sale to consumers in California by Releasees (as defined in section 4.1)
14 (“Covered Products”).

15 **1.7 State of the Pleadings**

16 On or around February 24, 2025, EHA filed a Complaint against Valley Fine Foods for the
17 alleged violations of Proposition 65 that are the subject of the Notice (“Complaint”).

18 **1.8 No Admission**

19 Valley Fine Foods denies the material factual and legal allegations of the Notice and Complaint
20 and maintains that all of the products it has manufactured, imported, sold, and/or distributed for sale in
21 California, including Covered Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all applicable laws,
22 rules and regulations. Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission of any fact,
23 finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Consent
24 Judgment be construed as an admission of any fact, finding, conclusion of law, issue of law, or violation
25 of law. This Section shall not, however, diminish or otherwise affect Valley Fine Foods 's obligations,
26 responsibilities, and duties under this Consent Judgment.

1.9 Jurisdiction

For purposes of this Consent Judgment and the Complaint only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has jurisdiction over Valley Fine Foods as to the allegations in the Complaint, that venue is proper in the County of Alameda, and that the Court has jurisdiction to enter and enforce the provisions of this Consent Judgment pursuant to Proposition 65 and Code of Civil Procedure section 664.6.

1.10 Effective Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Effective Date” means the date on which this Consent Judgment is approved by the Court, as discussed in Section 5.

1.11 Compliance Date

For purposes of this Consent Judgment, the term “Compliance Date” means 90 days from the date on which this Consent Judgment is approved and entered as a judgment of the Court, as discussed in Section 5.

2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

2.1 Reformulation of the Covered Products

Beginning on the Compliance Date, Defendant shall be permanently enjoined from manufacturing, distributing, or directly selling in the State of California, any Covered Product that exposes a person to a “Daily Cadmium Exposure Level” of more than 4.1 micrograms of cadmium based on a single serving per day unless such Covered Products comply with the warning requirements of Section 2.2. The “Daily Cadmium Exposure Level” shall be calculated by multiplying the recommended serving size in Covered Product by the concentration of cadmium in Covered Products. As used in this Section 2, “distributed for sale in CA” means to directly ship Covered Products into California or to sell Covered Products to a distributor Defendant knows will sell Covered Products in California.

2.2 Clear and Reasonable Warnings

For Covered Products that contain cadmium in a concentration exceeding the Reformulation Standard set forth in section 2.1 above, and which are distributed or directly sold by Valley Fine Foods in the State of California on or after the Compliance Date, Valley Fine Foods provide a “clear and reasonable” Proposition 65 warning, within the meaning of Section 2549.6 of the Act, subject to

Section 2.3 of this Agreement. Valley Fine Foods agrees that each warning shall be prominently placed with such conspicuousness, as compared with words, statements, designs, or devices as to render it likely to be seen, read, and understood by an ordinary individual under customary conditions before purchase or use. Each warning shall be provided in a manner such that the consumer or user understands to which specific Covered Products the warning applies, and which listed chemical(s) is/are implicated, so as to minimize the risk of consumer confusion.

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, a clear and reasonable warning for the Covered Products shall consist of a product-specific warning via one or more of the following methods: (1) A posted sign, shelf tag, or shelf sign for the consumer product at each point of display of the product; (2) Any electronic device or process that automatically provides the warning to the purchaser (not applicable to internet purchases, which are subject to the provisions of § 25602(b)); (3) A warning directly affixed to the product's label or tag; or (4) A short-form warning on the label that complies with the content requirements set forth in §§ 25603(b) and 25603(a). Specifically, pursuant to § 25603(a) – (d), one of the following statements must be utilized:

1) **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:”**: Consuming this product can expose you to chemicals including cadmium, which is known to the State of California to cause birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more information go to www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

OR

SHORT FORM 2) **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:”** Risk of reproductive harm from exposure to cadmium. See www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

OR

SHORT FORM 3) **“WARNING:” [or] “CA WARNING:” [or] “CALIFORNIA WARNING:”** Can expose you to cadmium, a reproductive toxicant. See www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

OR

1 **SHORT FORM ON**
 2 **A PRODUCT**
 3 **MANUFACTURED**
 4 **/LABELED PRIOR**
 5 **TO 1/1/28,**
 6 **REGARDLESS OF**
 7 **DATE OF SALE**

8 **4) WARNING:** Reproductive Harm – www.P65Warnings.ca.gov/food.

9 Pursuant to Section 25607.1, where the warning is provided on the food product label, it must
 10 be set off from other surrounding information and enclosed in a box. Where a specific food product
 11 sign, label, placard, or shelf tag is used to provide a warning, it must be displayed with such
 12 conspicuousness, as compared with other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read
 13 and understood by an ordinary individual prior to sale. In no case shall a warning statement appear in a
 14 type size smaller than 6-point type. Where a sign, labeling, or label as defined in Section 25600.1 is
 15 used to provide a warning that includes consumer information about a product in a language other than
 16 English, the warning must also be provided in that language in addition to English.

17 As set forth in Cal. Code Regs. Tit. 27, § 25602(b), to the extent Covered Products are sold
 18 online, a warning that complies with the content requirements of Cal. Code Regs Tit. 27, § 25603 must
 19 be provided via of the following methods: (1) A warning on the product display page; (2) A clearly
 20 marked hyperlink using the word “**WARNING**” or the words “**CA WARNING**” or “**CALIFORNIA**
 21 **WARNING**” on the product display page that links to the warning; or (3) An otherwise prominently
 22 displayed warning provided to the purchaser prior to completing the purchase. If a warning is provided
 23 using the short-form label content pursuant to Section 25602(a)(4), the warning provided on the website
 24 may use the same content. For purposes of this section, a warning is not prominently displayed if the
 25 purchaser must search for it in the general content of the website. For internet purchases made prior to
 26 1/1/28, a retail seller is not responsible under Section 25600.2(e)(4) for conspicuously posting or
 27 displaying the new warning online until 60 calendar days after the retailer receives a warning or a written
 28 notice under Section 25600.2(b) and (c) which updates a short-form warning compliant with Section
 25603(c) with content compliant with Section 25603(b). These requirements extend to any websites
 under the exclusive control of Valley Fine Foods where Covered Products are sold into California. In
 addition, Valley Fine Foods shall instruct any third-party website to which it directly sells its Covered

Products to include the same online warning, as set forth above, as a condition of selling the Covered Products in California.

2.3 Sell-Through Period

Notwithstanding anything else in this Consent Judgment, Covered Products that are manufactured, packaged, or put into commerce on or before the Compliance Date shall be subject to the release of liability pursuant to this Consent Judgment, without regard to when such Covered Products were, or are in the future, distributed or sold to customers. As a result, the obligations of Valley Fine Foods, or any Releasees (if applicable), stated in this Section 2 do not apply to Covered Products manufactured, packaged, or put into commerce between the date this Agreement is executed and the Compliance Date.

3. MONETARY SETTLEMENT TERMS

3.1 Settlement Amount

Valley Fine Foods shall pay sixty thousand dollars (\$60,000.00) in settlement and total satisfaction of all the claims referred to in the Notice(s), the Complaint, and this Consent Judgment. This includes civil penalties in the amount of twelve thousand fifty dollars (\$12,050.00) pursuant to Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b) and attorneys' fees and costs in the amount of forty-seven thousand nine hundred fifty dollars (\$47,950.00) pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1021.5.

3.2 Civil Penalty

The portion of the settlement attributable to civil penalties shall be allocated according to Health and Safety Code section 25249.12(c)(1) and (d), with seventy-five percent (75%) of the penalty paid to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA"), and the remaining twenty-five percent (25%) of the penalty paid to EHA individually. The twelve thousand fifty dollars (\$12,050.00) in civil penalties shall be paid as follows:

- One payment of \$9,037.50 to OEHHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective Date.
- One payment of \$3,012.50 to EHA, due fourteen (14) days after the Effective date.

All payments owed to EHA shall be delivered to the following address:

Environmental Health Advocates
225 Broadway, Suite 2100
San Diego, CA 92101

All payments owed to OEHHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) shall be delivered directly to OEHHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Federal Express 2-Day Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Valley Fine Foods agrees to provide EHA's counsel with a copy of the check payable to OEHHHA, simultaneous with its penalty payment to EHA.

Plaintiff and its counsel will provide completed IRS 1099, W-9, or other tax forms as required (the "Tax Information"). Relevant information is set out below:

- "Environmental Health Advocates, Inc." (EIN: 84-2322975) at the address provided above.
- "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814.

All payments referenced in Section 3 shall be paid within fourteen (14) days of the date the Court approves EHA's motion to approve this Consent Judgment, unless Plaintiff and its counsel fail to provide the required Tax Information prior to Court approval, at which point Valley Fine Foods's payment obligations will be due fourteen (14) days after receipt of the Tax Information.

3.3 Attorney's Fees and Costs

The portion of the settlement attributable to attorneys' fees and costs shall be paid to EHA's counsel, who are entitled to attorneys' fees and costs incurred by it in this action, including but not limited to investigating potential violations, bringing this matter to Valley Fine Foods 's attention, as well as litigating and negotiating a settlement in the public interest.

Valley Fine Foods shall provide its payment for civil penalty and for attorneys' fees and costs to EHA's counsel by physical check or by electronic means, including wire transfers, at Valley Fine Foods's discretion, as follows: forty-seven thousand nine hundred fifty dollars (\$47,950.00) in

1 Attorney's Fees and Costs shall be paid as one payment of \$47,950.00, due fourteen (14) days after the
2 Effective Date.

3
4 The attorney fee payments shall be made payable to Entorno Law, LLP and delivered to:

5 Noam Glick
6 Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 1900
7 San Diego, CA 92101

8 **4. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASE**

9 **4.1 EHA's Public Release of Proposition 65 Claims**

10 Plaintiff, acting on its own behalf and in the public interest, releases Valley Fine Foods, and its
11 parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities under common ownership or control, its directors, officers,
12 principals, agents, employees, attorneys, insurers, accountants, predecessors, successors, and assigns
13 ("Defendant Entities"), each entity to whom Defendant directly or indirectly distributes, ships, or sells
14 the Covered Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers,
15 retailers (including but not limited to Valley Fine Foods Company, LLC), and marketplaces
16 franchisees, franchisors, cooperative members, suppliers, licensees, and licensors, and all of the
17 foregoing entities' owners, directors, officers, agents, principals, employees, attorneys, insurers,
18 accountants, representatives, predecessors, successors, and assigns (collectively referred to as the
19 "Releasees") from all claims for violations of Proposition 65 up through the Compliance Date based
20 on exposure to cadmium from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice(s). Compliance with the
21 terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 with respect to exposures
22 to cadmium from Covered Products as set forth in the Notice(s). This Consent Judgment is a full, final,
23 and binding resolution of all claims under Proposition 65 that were or could have been asserted against
24 Valley Fine Foods and/or Releasees for failure to comply with Proposition 65 for alleged exposure to
25 cadmium from Covered Products. This release does not extend to any third-party retailers selling the
26 product on a website who, after receiving instruction from Valley Fine Foods to include a warning as
27 set forth above in section 2.2, do not include such a warning.

4.2 EHA's Individual Release of Claims

EHA, in its individual capacity, also provides a release to Valley Fine Foods and/or Releasees, which shall be a full and final accord and satisfaction of, as well as a bar to, all actions, causes of action, obligations, costs, expenses, attorneys' fees, damages, losses, claims, liabilities, and demands of every nature, character, and kind, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, arising out of alleged or actual exposures to cadmium in Covered Products manufactured, imported, sold, or distributed by Valley Fine Foods before the Effective Date.

4.3 Valley Fine Foods's Release of EHA

Valley Fine Foods hereby waives any and all claims against EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made by EHA and its attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims, otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against them, in this matter or with respect to the Covered Products.

4.4 No Other Known Claims or Violations

EHA and EHA's counsel affirm that they are not presently aware of any actual or alleged violations of Proposition 65 by Valley Fine Foods or for which Valley Fine Foods bears legal responsibility other than those that are fully resolved by this Consent Judgment.

5. COURT APPROVAL

This Consent Judgment is not effective until it is approved by the Court and shall be null and void if it is not approved by the Court within one year after it has been fully executed by the Parties, or by such additional time as the Parties may agree to in writing.

6. SEVERABILITY

Subsequent to the Court's approval and entry of this Consent Judgment, if any provision is held by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the remaining provisions shall not be affected.

7. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the laws of the state of California as applied within the state of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed, or is otherwise rendered inapplicable for reasons, including but not limited to changes in the law; or in the event the California Office of Health Hazard Assessment adopts a regulation or safe use determination, or issues

an interpretive guideline that exempts Covered Products from meeting the requirements of Proposition 65; or if cadmium cases are permanently enjoined by a court of competent jurisdiction; or if Proposition 65 is determined to be preempted by federal law or a burden on First Amendment rights with respect to cadmium in Covered Products or Covered Products substantially similar to Covered Products, then Valley Fine Foods may seek relief from the injunctive obligations imposed by this Consent Judgment to the extent any Covered Products are so affected by modifying the agreement via the mechanisms set forth in Section 12.

8. ENFORCEMENT

In any action to enforce the terms of this Consent Judgment, the prevailing party shall be entitled to its reasonable attorneys' fees and costs.

9. NOTICE

Unless otherwise specified herein, all correspondence and notice required by this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and sent by: (i) personal delivery; (ii) first-class, registered, or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (iii) a recognized overnight courier; and (iv) with a copy by email; to the following addresses:

If to Valley Fine Foods:

William F. Tarantino
Morrison & Foerster LLP
425 Market Street, Suite 3200
San Francisco, CA 94105
WTarantino@mofo.com

If to EHA:

Noam Glick
Entorno Law, LLP
225 Broadway, Suite 2100
San Diego, CA 92101
noam@entornolaw.com

Cedar Hobbs
Morrison & Foerster LLP
12531 High Bluff Dr
San Diego, CA 92130
CHobbs@mofo.com

Any Party may, from time to time, specify in writing to the other, a change of address to which notices and other communications shall be sent.

10. COUNTERPARTS; DIGITAL SIGNATURES

This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document.

1 **11. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES**

2 EHA agrees to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in Health and Safety
3 Code section 25249.7(f). The Parties further acknowledge that, pursuant to Health and Safety Code
4 section 25249.7(f), a noticed motion is required to obtain judicial approval of the settlement, which
5 motion EHA shall draft and file. In furtherance of obtaining such approval, the Parties agree to mutually
6 employ their reasonable best efforts, including those of their counsel, to support the entry of this
7 agreement as judgment, and to obtain judicial approval of their settlement in a timely manner. For
8 purposes of this Section, “best efforts” shall include, at a minimum, supporting the motion for approval,
9 responding to any objection that any third-party may make, and appearing at the hearing before the
10 Court if so requested.

11 **12. MODIFICATION**

12 This Consent Judgment may be modified by: (i) a written agreement of the Parties and entry of
13 a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court; or (ii) a successful motion or application of any
14 Party, and the entry of a modified consent judgment thereon by the Court.

15 **13. AUTHORIZATION**

16 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment and acknowledge that they
17 have read, understand, and agree to all of the terms and conditions contained herein.

18 **14. GOOD FAITH ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE DISPUTES**

19 If a dispute arises with respect to either Party’s compliance with the terms of this Consent
20 Judgment entered by the Court, the Parties shall meet and confer in person, or by telephone, and
21 endeavor to resolve the dispute in an amicable manner. No action or motion may be filed in the absence
22 of such a good faith attempt to resolve the dispute beforehand.

23 **15. ENTIRE AGREEMENT**

24 This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement and understanding of the Parties
25 with respect to the entire subject matter herein, and any and all prior discussions, negotiations,
26 commitments, and understandings related hereto. No representations, oral or otherwise, express or
27 implied, other than those contained herein have been made by any Party. No other agreements, oral or
28 otherwise, unless specifically referred to herein, shall be deemed to exist or to bind any Party.

1 **AGREED TO:**

2 5/12/2026
3 Date: _____

4 
5 By: _____
6 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH
7 ADVOCATES, INC.

AGREED TO:

Date: 5/7/2026

DocuSigned by:
Bryan Callen
7D2A0485B9D34C7...
By: _____
VALLEY FINE FOODS COMPANY, LLC

8 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

9
10 Date: _____

JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT