

1 Evan J. Smith, Esquire (SBN 242352)  
2 Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire (SBN 302113)  
3 BRODSKY SMITH  
4 9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300  
5 Beverly Hills, CA 90212  
6 Telephone: (877) 534-2590  
7 Facsimile: (310) 247-0160

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

9  
10 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
11 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

12 EMA BELL, GABRIEL ESPINOZA,

13 Plaintiffs,

14 v.

15 HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.,

16 Defendant.

Case No.: 25STCV12313

**CONSENT JUDGMENT**

Judge: Daniel M. Crowley

Dept.: 729

Hearing Date: July 22, 2026

Hearing Time: 8:30 AM

Reservation ID: 943866288939

Complaint Filed: July 17, 2024

1       **1. INTRODUCTION**

2           1.1       **The Parties.** This Consent Judgment is entered into by and between plaintiffs  
3 Gabriel Espinoza (“Espinoza”) and Ema Bell (“Bell”) acting on behalf of the public interest  
4 (collectively, “Plaintiffs” and each a “Plaintiff”) on the one hand, and defendant Hobby Lobby  
5 Stores, Inc. (“Hobby Lobby” or “Defendant”) on the other hand, with Plaintiffs and Defendant  
6 collectively referred to as the “Parties” and each of them as a “Party.” Each Plaintiff is an individual  
7 residing in California that seeks to promote awareness of exposures to toxic chemicals and improve  
8 human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products.  
9 Hobby Lobby is alleged to be a person in the course of doing business for purposes of Proposition  
10 65, Cal. Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.6 et seq.

11           1.2       **Allegations and Representations.** Plaintiffs allege that Defendant has exposed  
12 individuals to di(2-ethylhexyl) phthalate (DEHP) and/or dissononyl phthalate (“DINP”) from its  
13 sales of products without providing a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to  
14 Proposition 65. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of  
15 California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. DINP is listed pursuant to  
16 Proposition 65 as a chemical known to the State of California to cause cancer.

17           1.3       **Notices of Violation/Action.**

18           1.3.1     On October 25, 2023, Bell served Defendant and various public enforcement  
19 agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code  
20 §25249.7(d) (the “First October Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for  
21 failing to warn consumers and customers that use of *Sewology*® quilting tape measures expose  
22 users in California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims  
23 alleged in the First October Notice.

24           1.3.2     On October 25, 2023, Bell served Defendant and various public enforcement  
25 agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health & Safety Code  
26 §25249.7(d) (the “Second October Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for  
27 failing to warn consumers and customers that use of large shell gift plastic bags expose users in  
28

1 California to DEHP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently prosecuting the claims alleged  
2 in the Second October Notice.

3 1.3.3 On March 13, 2025, Espinoza served Defendant and various public  
4 enforcement agencies with documents entitled “60-Day Notice of Violation” pursuant to Health &  
5 Safety Code §25249.7(d) (the “March Notice”), alleging that Defendant violated Proposition 65 for  
6 failing to warn consumers and customers that use of Brother Sister Design Studio plush bags for  
7 children expose users in California to DINP. No public enforcer has brought and is diligently  
8 prosecuting the claims alleged in the March Notice<sup>1</sup>.

9 1.3.4 On July 17, 2024, Bell filed a complaint in the Superior Court of California,  
10 County of San Francisco, Case No. CGC-24-616498 (“Complaint”). On April 28, 2025, Bell and  
11 Defendant stipulated to transfer venue from San Francisco County to Los Angeles County, Case  
12 No. 25STCV12313.

13 1.3.5 On March 30, 2026, Bell and Defendant stipulated to file a first amended  
14 complaint (“First Amended Complaint”). On May 7, 2026, Bell filed the First Amended  
15 Complaint<sup>2</sup>.

16 1.4 For purposes of this Consent Judgment only, the Parties stipulate that this Court has  
17 jurisdiction over Defendant as to the allegations contained in the Action filed in this matter, that  
18 venue is proper in the County of Los Angeles, and that this Court has jurisdiction to approve, enter,  
19 and oversee the enforcement of this Consent Judgment as a full and final binding resolution of all  
20 claims which were or could have been raised in the Action based on the facts alleged therein and  
21 in the Notices.

22 1.5 Defendant denies the material allegations and legal allegations contained in  
23 Plaintiffs’ Notices and Action and maintains that, to the best of its knowledge, all products that are  
24 or have been sold and distributed in California have been and are in compliance with all laws.

25 \_\_\_\_\_  
26 <sup>1</sup> The First October Notice, Second October Notice, and March Notice are collectively referred to  
herein as, the “Notices.”

27 <sup>2</sup> The Complaint and First Amended Complaint are collectively referred to herein as, the  
28 “Complaints.”

1 Nothing in this Consent Judgment shall be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact,  
2 finding, issue of law, or violation of law; nor shall compliance with this Consent Judgment  
3 constitute or be construed as an admission by Defendant of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of  
4 law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Defendant. However, this section shall  
5 not diminish or otherwise affect the obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Consent  
6 Judgment. Notwithstanding the allegations in the Notices and Action, Hobby Lobby maintains that  
7 it has not knowingly manufactured, or caused to be manufactured, products for sale in California  
8 in violation of Proposition 65.

9 **2. DEFINITIONS**

10 2.1 **Covered Products.** The term “Covered Products” means:

11 2.1.1 *Brother Sister Design Studio®* plush items for children sold under purchase  
12 order HL9200447, including but not limited to SKU Nos. 6278956, 6278964, and 6278972, that  
13 are manufactured, distributed, shipped into California and offered for sale in California by Hobby  
14 Lobby that may expose users to phthalates including DINP.

15 2.1.2 Tape Measures, including but not limited to Sew Ology Quilters Tape  
16 Measures SKU No. 783993, that are manufactured, distributed, shipped into California and offered  
17 for sale in California by Hobby Lobby that may expose users to phthalates including DEHP.

18 2.1.3 Durable Storage Bags with Shells, including but not limited to the Large  
19 Shell Gift Plastic Bag SKU No. 375238, that are manufactured, distributed, shipped into California  
20 and offered for sale in California by Hobby Lobby that expose may users to phthalates including  
21 DEHP.

22 2.2 **Effective Date.** The term “Effective Date” means the date this Consent Judgment is  
23 entered as a Judgment of the Court.

24 **3. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION AND/OR WARNINGS**

25 3.1 **Reformulation of Covered Products.** Commencing within ninety (90) days after  
26 the Effective Date, and continuing thereafter, Covered Products that Hobby Lobby directly  
27 manufactures, imports, distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California shall either be: (a)  
28

1 Reformulated DEHP Products pursuant to § 3.2, below; (b) Reformulated DINP Products pursuant  
2 to § 3.2, below or (c) be labeled with a clear and reasonable exposure warning pursuant to §§ 3.3  
3 and 3.4, below. The warning requirement set forth in §§ 3.3 and 3.4 shall not apply to any  
4 Reformulated DEHP Products or Reformulated DINP Products.


5 **3.2 Reformulation Standards.**

6 3.2.1 “Reformulated DEHP Products” shall mean Covered Products that contain  
7 concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DEHP when analyzed  
8 pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or  
9 other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining  
10 the phthalate content in a solid substance.


11 3.2.2 “Reformulated DINP Products” shall mean Covered Products that contain  
12 concentrations less than or equal to 0.1% (1,000 parts per million (ppm)) of DINP when analyzed  
13 pursuant to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C or  
14 other methodology utilized by federal or state government agencies for the purpose of determining  
15 the phthalate content in a solid substance.

16 **3.3 Clear and Reasonable Warning.** Commencing within 90 days after the Effective  
17 Date, and continuing thereafter, a clear and reasonable exposure warning as set forth in this §§ 3.2  
18 and 3.3 must be provided for all Covered Products that Defendant manufacturers, imports,  
19 distributes, sells, or offers for sale in California that is not a Reformulated DEHP Product or  
20 Reformulated DINP Product. There shall be no obligation for Defendant to provide a warning for  
21 Covered Products that enter the stream of commerce within 90 days after the Effective Date. The  
22 warning shall consist of either the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** described below:


- 23 (a) For *Brother Sister Design Studio*® plush items for children sold under purchase  
24 order HL9200447, including but not limited to SKU Nos. 6278956, 6278964, and  
25 6278972, the “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

26  **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including phthalates  
27 (including Di(Iso-Nonyl)phthalate [DINP]), which are known to the State of  
28 California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more  
information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).


1 (b) For Tape Measures, including but not limited to Sew Ology Quilters Tape Measures  
2 SKU No. 783993, the “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

3  **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including phthalates  
4 (including Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate [DEHP]), which are known to the State of  
5 California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more  
6 information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

6 (c) For Durable Storage Bags with Shells, including but not limited to the Large Shell  
7 Gift Plastic Bag SKU No. 375238, the “Warning” shall consist of the statement:

8  **WARNING:** This product can expose you to chemicals including phthalates  
9 (including Di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate [DEHP]), which are known to the State of  
10 California to cause cancer and birth defects or other reproductive harm. For more  
11 information go to [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).

11 (d) **Alternative Warning:** For Covered Products that create an exposure to phthalates  
12 (including but not limited to DEHP and DINP), Hobby Lobby may, but is not required to, use the  
13 alternative short-form warning as set forth in this § 3.3(b) (“**Alternative Warning**”) as follows:

14  **WARNING:** Cancer and Reproductive Harm - [www.P65Warnings.ca.gov](http://www.P65Warnings.ca.gov).<sup>3</sup>

15 3.4 A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** provided pursuant to § 3.3 must print the word  
16 “**WARNING:**” in all capital letters and in bold font, followed by a colon. The warning symbol to  
17 the left of the word “**WARNING:**” must be a black exclamation point in a yellow equilateral  
18 triangle with a black outline, except that if the sign or label for the Covered Product does not use  
19 the color yellow, the symbol may be in black and white. The symbol must be in a size no smaller  
20 than the height of the word “**WARNING:**”. The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** shall be affixed  
21 to or printed on the Covered Product’s packaging or labeling, or on a placard, shelf tag, sign or  
22 electronic device or automatic process only if such electronic device or automatic process provides  
23 the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** without the purchaser having to seek it out, providing that  
24 the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** is displayed with such conspicuousness, as compared with  
25 other words, statements, or designs as to render it likely to be read and understood by an ordinary  
26 individual under customary conditions of purchase or use. A **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**

27 <sup>3</sup> This short-form warning may be used on a product manufactured or labeled prior to  
28 January 1, 2028, regardless of the date of sale. However, after January 1, 2028, all short-form  
labels shall be provided in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, § 25603(b).

1 provided via an electronic device or automatic process does not apply to internet purchases, which  
2 are subject to the provisions of Section 25602(b). The **Warning** or **Alternative Warning** may be  
3 contained in the same section of the packaging, labeling, or instruction booklet that states other  
4 safety warnings, if any, concerning the use of the Covered Product and shall be at least the same  
5 size as those other safety warnings. If “consumer information,” as that term is defined in Title 27,  
6 California Code of Regulations, Section 25600.1(c) as it may be amended from time to time, is  
7 provided in a foreign language, Hobby Lobby shall provide the **Warning** or **Alternative Warning**  
8 in the foreign language in accordance with applicable warning regulations adopted by the State of  
9 California’s Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (“OEHHA”). An **Alternative**  
10 **Warning** on a Covered Product manufactured and labeled after January 1, 2028 shall be provided  
11 in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations, § 25603(b).

12 As set forth in Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25602(b), to the extent Covered Products are sold  
13 online, a warning that complies with the content requirements of Cal. Code Regs. tit. 27, § 25603  
14 must be provided via one of the following methods: (1) A warning on the product display page; (2)  
15 A clearly marked hyperlink using the work “WARNING” or the words “CA WARNING” or  
16 “CALIFORNIA WARNING” on the product display page that links to the warning; or (3) An  
17 otherwise prominently displayed warning provided to the purchaser prior to completing the  
18 purchase. If a warning is provided using the short-form label content pursuant to Section  
19 25602(a)(4), the warning provided on the website may use the same content. For purposes of this  
20 section, a warning is not prominently displayed of the purchaser must search for it in the general  
21 content of the website. For internet purchases made prior to 1/1/2028, a retail seller is not  
22 responsible under Section 25600.2(e)(4) for conspicuously posting or displaying the new warning  
23 online until 60 calendar days after the retailer received a warning or a written notice under Section  
24 25600.2(b) and (c) which updates a short-form warning compliant with Section 25603(c) with  
25 content compliant with Section 25603(b). These requirements extend to any websites under the  
26 exclusive control of Hobby Lobby where Covered Products are sold into California. In addition,  
27 Hobby Lobby shall provide any third-party website with written notice in accordance with Title 27,  
28

1 California Code of Regulations, § 25600.2. Third-party internet sellers of the Covered Product that  
2 have been provided with written notice in accordance with Title 27, California Code of Regulations,  
3 § 25600.2 are not released in Section 6 of this Agreement if they fail to meet the warning  
4 requirements herein.

5       **3.5 Compliance with Warning Regulations.** Defendant shall be deemed to be in  
6 compliance with this Consent Judgment by either adhering to §§ 3.3 and 3.4 of this Consent  
7 Judgment or by complying with warning regulations adopted by OEHHA applicable to the Covered  
8 Products and exposures at issue within 90 days after the Effective Date.

9 **4. ENFORCEMENT**

10       **4.1** Prior to bringing any motion or application to enforce the requirements of Section 3  
11 above, Plaintiff shall provide Defendant with a Notice of Violation and a copy of any test results  
12 which purportedly support the Notice of Violation. The Parties shall then meet and confer regarding  
13 the basis for the anticipated motion or application in an attempt to resolve it informally, including  
14 providing the Defendant with a reasonable opportunity of at least ninety (90) days to cure any  
15 alleged violation. Should such attempts at informal resolution fail, Plaintiff may file an enforcement  
16 motion or application. This Consent Judgment may only be enforce by the Parties.

17 **5. MONETARY TERMS**

18       **5.1 Civil Penalty.** Hobby Lobby shall pay \$3,000.00 as a Civil Penalty pursuant to  
19 Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(b), to be apportioned in accordance with California Health  
20 & Safety Code § 25249.12, with 75% of these funds remitted to OEHHA and the remaining 25%  
21 of the Civil Penalty remitted to Plaintiffs, as provided by California Health & Safety Code  
22 § 25249.12(d).

23               **4.1.1** Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Hobby Lobby shall issue three  
24 separate checks for the Civil Penalty payment to (a) “OEHHA” in the amount of \$2,250.00; (b)  
25 “Ema Bell” in the amount of \$500.00; and (c) “Gabriel Espinoza” in the amount of \$250.00.

26 Payment owed to Plaintiffs pursuant to this Section shall be delivered to the following payment  
27 address:

28       Evan J. Smith, Esquire

1 Brodsky Smith  
2 Two Bala Plaza, Suite 805  
3 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004

4 Payment owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486) pursuant to this Section shall be delivered directly  
5 to OEHHA (Memo Line "Prop 65 Penalties") at one of the following address(es):

6 For United States Postal Service Delivery:

7 Mike Gyurics  
8 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
9 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
10 P.O. Box 4010  
11 Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

12 For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

13 Mike Gyurics  
14 Fiscal Operations Branch Chief  
15 Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment  
16 1001 I Street  
17 Sacramento, CA 95814

18 A copy of the check payable to OEHHA shall be mailed to Brodsky Smith at the address set forth  
19 above as proof of payment to OEHHA.

20 5.1 **Tax Documentation.** Hobby Lobby agrees to provide a completed IRS 1099 for its  
21 payments to, and Espinoza agrees to provide IRS W-9 forms for, each of the following payees  
22 under this Consent Judgment:

23 5.1.1 "Gabriel Espinoza" whose address and tax identification number shall be  
24 provided within five (5) days after this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court;

25 5.1.2 "Ema Bell" whose address and tax identification number shall be provided  
26 within five (5) days after this Consent Judgment is entered by the Court;

27 5.1.3 "Brodsky & Smith, LLC" (EIN: 23-2971061) at the address provided in  
28 Section 5.1.1; and

5.1.4 "Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment" 1001 I Street,  
Sacramento, CA 95814.

5.2 **Attorneys' Fees.** The Parties acknowledge that Gabriel Espinoza, Ema Bell and  
their counsel offered to reach preliminary agreement on the material terms of this dispute before  
reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them. The Parties thereafter

1 reached an accord on the compensation due to Gabriel Espinoza, Ema Bell, and their counsel under  
2 general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine and principles codified at  
3 California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution  
4 of this agreement. Under these legal principles, Defendant shall reimburse Bell's and Espinoza's  
5 counsel for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating and bringing this matter to Hobby  
6 Lobby's attention, litigating and negotiating, and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the  
7 public interest. Within ten (10) days of the Effective Date, Hobby Lobby shall pay \$39,000.00 to  
8 Brodsky Smith as complete reimbursement for Plaintiffs' attorneys' fees and costs incurred as a  
9 result of investigating, bringing this matter to the attention of Hobby Lobby, litigating and  
10 negotiating and obtaining judicial approval of a settlement in the public interest, pursuant to Code  
11 of Civil Procedure § 1021.5.

12 **6. RELEASE OF ALL CLAIMS**

13 6.1 This Consent Judgment is a full, final, and binding resolution between Plaintiffs  
14 acting on their own behalf, and on behalf of the public interest, and Hobby Lobby, and its parents,  
15 shareholders, marketplaces, members, directors, officers, managers, employees, representatives,  
16 agents, attorneys, divisions, subdivisions, subsidiaries, partners, sister companies, and affiliates,  
17 and their predecessors, successors and assigns, and all entities to whom they directly or indirectly  
18 distribute, license or sell Covered Products, including but not limited to its downstream distributors,  
19 wholesalers, customers, vendors, licensors, shareholders, licensees, retailers, franchisees,  
20 cooperative members, owners, users, and licensees ("Downstream Releasees"), of all claims that  
21 can or could have been asserted by Espinoza or Bell, on their own behalf, on behalf of the public  
22 interest, and on behalf of Espinoza's and Bell's past and current agents, representatives, attorneys,  
23 successors and assignees ("Releasers") for all actions, causes of action, and claims, in law or in  
24 equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses or expenses  
25 (including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees) of any nature  
26 whatsoever, whether known or unknown, fixed or contingent (collectively, "Claims") based on for  
27 violations of Proposition 65 based on exposure to phthalates including DEHP and DINP from use  
28

1 of the Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by Hobby Lobby within 90 days after  
2 the Effective Date as set forth in the Notices. It is the Parties' intention that this Consent Judgment  
3 shall have preclusive effect such that no other actions by private enforcers, whether purporting to  
4 act in his, her, or its interests or the public interest shall be permitted to pursue and take any action  
5 with respect to any violation of Proposition 65 based on exposure to phthalates including DEHP  
6 and DINP from use of the Covered Products that was alleged in the Action, or that could have been  
7 brought pursuant to the Notices against Hobby Lobby and the Downstream Releasees ("Proposition  
8 65 Claims"). Hobby Lobby's compliance with the terms of this Consent Judgment constitutes  
9 compliance with Proposition 65 by Hobby Lobby with regard to exposure to DEHP from use of the  
10 Tape Measures and Durable Storage Bags with Shell. Hobby Lobby's compliance with the terms  
11 of this Consent Judgment constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Hobby Lobby with regard  
12 to exposure to DINP from use of the *Brother Sister Design Studio*® plush items for children.

13           6.2 In addition to the foregoing, Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves, their past and  
14 current agents, representatives, attorneys, and successors and assignees, and *not* in their  
15 representative capacity, hereby waives all rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly,  
16 any form of legal action and releases Hobby Lobby and Defendant Releasees from any and all  
17 manner of actions, causes of action, claims, demands, rights, suits, obligations, debts, contracts,  
18 agreements, promises, liabilities, damages, charges, losses, costs, fines, penalties, expenses,  
19 investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees, of any nature whatsoever, known or unknown,  
20 in law or equity, fixed or contingent, now or in the future, with respect to any alleged violations of  
21 Proposition 65 related to or arising from Covered Products manufactured, distributed, or sold by  
22 Hobby Lobby or Defendant Releasees. With respect to the foregoing waivers and releases in this  
23 paragraph, Plaintiffs hereby acknowledge that the claims released in this paragraph may include  
24 unknown claims, and nonetheless specifically waives any and all rights and benefits which they  
25 now have, or in the future may have, conferred by virtue of the provisions of § 1542 of the  
26 California Civil Code, which provides as follows:

27           A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE  
28           CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO

1           EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE  
2           RELEASE AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE  
3           MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE  
4           DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

5           Plaintiffs acknowledge and understand the significance and consequences of this specific waiver  
6           of California Civil Code § 1542.

7           6.3     Hobby Lobby waives any and all claims against Plaintiffs, their attorneys and other  
8           representatives, for any and all actions taken, or statements made (or those that could have been  
9           taken or made) by Plaintiffs and their attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of  
10          investigating claims or otherwise seeking enforcement of Proposition 65 against it in this matter,  
11          and with respect to Covered Products.

12          7.     **DEEMED COMPLIANCE WITH PROPOSITION 65**

13          7.1     The Parties agree that compliance by Hobby Lobby with this Settlement Agreement  
14          constitutes compliance with Proposition 65 by Hobby Lobby with respect to exposure to phthalates  
15          including DEHP from use of the Tape Measures and Durable Storage Bags with Shell and/or DINP  
16          from use of the *Brother Sister Design Studio*® plush items for children.

17          7.2     **Public Benefit.** It is Hobby Lobby's understanding that the commitments it has  
18          agreed to herein, and actions to be taken by Hobby Lobby under this Consent Judgment, would  
19          confer a significant benefit to the general public, as set forth in Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5  
20          and Ca. Admin. Code tit. 11, § 3201. As such, it is the intent of Hobby Lobby that to the extent any  
21          other private part initiates an action alleging a violation of Proposition 65 with respect to Hobby  
22          Lobby's failure to provide a warning concerning exposure to phthalates including DINP prior to  
23          use of the Covered Products it has manufactured, distributed, sold, or offered for sale in California,  
24          or will manufacture, distribute, sell, or offer for sale in California, such private party action would  
25          not confer a significant benefit on the general public as to those Covered Products addressed in this  
26          Consent Judgment, provided that Hobby Lobby is in material compliance with this Consent  
27          Judgment.

1     **8. INTEGRATION**

2             8.1     This Consent Judgment contains the sole and entire agreement of the Parties and  
3 any and all prior negotiations and understandings related hereto shall be deemed to have been  
4 merged within it. No representations or terms of agreement other than those contained herein exist  
5 or have been made by any Party with respect to the other Party or the subject matter hereof.

6     **9. SEVERABILITY**

7             9.1     If subsequent to the execution of this Consent Judgment, any of the provisions of  
8 this Consent Judgment are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable  
9 provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected but only to the extent the deletion of the  
10 provision deemed unenforceable does not materially affect, or otherwise result in the effect of the  
11 Consent Judgment being contrary to the intent of the Parties in entering into this Consent Judgment.

12     **10. GOVERNING LAW**

13             10.1     The terms of this Consent Judgment shall be governed by the law of the State of  
14 California and apply within the State of California.

15     **11. NOTICES**

16             11.1     Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided  
17 pursuant to this Consent Judgment shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (i) first-  
18 class, (registered or certified mail) return receipt requested; or (ii) overnight courier on any party  
19 by the other party at the following addresses:

20     For Defendant:

21             Anne Marie Ellis  
22             Buchalter LLP  
23             18400 Von Karman Avenue, Ste. 800  
24             Irvine, CA 92612

25     And

26     For Plaintiffs:

27             Evan Smith  
28             Brodsky Smith  
29             9465 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 300  
30             Beverly Hills, CA 90212

1 Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to  
2 which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

3 **12. COUNTERPARTS; FACSIMILE SIGNATURES**

4 12.1 This Consent Judgment may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or .pdf  
5 signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall  
6 constitute one and the same document.

7 **13. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)/COURT**  
8 **APPROVAL**

9 13.1 Plaintiffs agree to comply with the requirements set forth in California Health &  
10 Safety Code § 25249.7(f) and to promptly bring a Motion for Approval of this Consent Judgment.  
11 Defendant agrees it shall support approval of such Motion.

12 13.2 This Consent Judgment shall not be effective until it is approved and entered by the  
13 Court and shall be null and void if, for any reason, it is not approved by the Court. In such case, the  
14 Parties agree to meet and confer on how to proceed and if such agreement is not reached within 30  
15 days, the case shall proceed on its normal course.

16 13.3 If the Court approves this Consent Judgment and is reversed or vacated by an  
17 appellate court, the Parties shall meet and confer as to whether to modify the terms of this Consent  
18 Judgment. If the Parties do not jointly agree on a course of action to take, the case shall proceed on  
19 its normal course on the trial court's calendar.

20 **14. MODIFICATION**

21 14.1 This Consent Judgment may be modified only by further stipulation of the Parties  
22 and the approval of the Court or upon the granting of a motion brought to the Court by either Party.

23 **15. ATTORNEY'S FEES**

24 15.1 A Party who unsuccessfully brings or contests an action arising out of this Consent  
25 Judgment shall be required to pay the prevailing party's reasonable attorney's fees and costs.

26 15.2 Nothing in this Section shall preclude a Party from seeking an award of sanctions  
27 pursuant to law.

28

1 **16. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

2 16.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
3 Consent Judgment.

4 **17. AUTHORIZATION**

5 17.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
6 respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
7 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
8 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
9 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: 5-5-26

By: \_\_\_\_\_

GABRIEL ESPINOZA

By: 

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

**AGREED TO:**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_

EMA BELL

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court

1 **16. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

2 16.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the  
3 Consent Judgment.

4 **17. AUTHORIZATION**

5 17.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their  
6 respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this  
7 document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute  
8 the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as  
9 explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

11 **AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

12  
13 Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

14 By: \_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_

15 GABRIEL ESPINOZA

HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

16  
17 **AGREED TO:**

18  
19 Date: \_\_\_\_\_ 6/2/26

20 By: \_\_\_\_\_

21 EMA BELL

22  
23 **IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

24  
25 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**16. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

16.1 This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter to implement or modify the Consent Judgment.

**17. AUTHORIZATION**

17.1 The undersigned are authorized to execute this Consent Judgment on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this document and certify that he or she is fully authorized by the Party he or she represents to execute the Consent Judgment on behalf of the Party represented and legally bind that Party. Except as explicitly provided herein each Party is to bear its own fees and costs.

**AGREED TO:**

**AGREED TO:**

Date: 6 | 2 | 26

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

By: GABRIEL ESPINOZA

By: HOBBY LOBBY STORES, INC.

**AGREED TO:**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

By: EMA BELL

**IT IS SO ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:**

Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Judge of Superior Court