

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Tel: 619-629-0527 noam@entornolaw.com 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

October 5, 2023

Via USPS Mail

On Target Living, LLC Attn. Legal Dept. 35 Monarch Lane Okemos, MI 48864

On Target Living, LLC c/o Christopher B Johnson 211 Harrier Drive Bath, MI 48808 Amazon.com Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, DE 19808

Amazon.com, Inc. Attn. Legal Dept. 410 Terry Ave. North Seattle, WA 98109

Re: Withdrawal of Proposition 65 Notice of Violation

To Whom It May Concern:

Please take notice that Environmental Health Advocates, Inc. hereby withdraws its 60-Day Notice of Violation AG 2023-02456, a copy of which is enclosed with this letter.

Please do not hesitate to contact our office with any questions.

Sincerely,

Noon Slick

Noam Glick



ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Tel: 619-629-0527 noam@entornolaw.com craig@entornolaw.com jake@entornolaw.com janani@entornolaw.com 225 Broadway, Suite 1900 San Diego, CA 92101

August 10, 2023

On Target Living, LLC Attn. Legal Dept. 35 Monarch Lane Okemos, MI 48864

Via Certified Mail

On Target Living, LLC c/o Christopher B Johnson 211 Harrier Drive Bath, MI 48808 Amazon.com Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, Delaware 19808

Amazon.com, Inc. Attn. Legal Dept 410 Terry Avenue North Seattle, WA 98109

Re: Proposition 65 Notice of Violation

To Whom It May Concern:

We represent Environmental Health Advocates, Inc., an organization in the State of California acting in the interest of the general public. This letter serves as notice that the parties listed above are in violation of Proposition 65, the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act, commencing with section 25249.5 of the Health and Safety Code ("Proposition 65"). In particular, the violations alleged by this notice consist of types of harm that may potentially result from exposures to the toxic chemical Lead. Lead was listed as a developmental and reproductive toxin on February 27, 1987 and listed as a carcinogen on October 1, 1992.

The type of product that is causing exposures in violation of Proposition 65 is dietary supplements, including but not limited to:

	Product Name	<u>Manufacturer</u>	Distributor/Retailer
1.	Spirulina Chlorella Tablets	On Target Living, LLC	Amazon.com, Inc. / On Target Living, LLC

The routes of exposure to the chemical(s) in violation include ingestion by consumers. These exposures occur through the reasonably foreseeable use of the product. The sales of this product have been occurring since at least March 2023, are continuing to this day, and will continue to occur as long as the product subject to this notice is sold to and used by consumers.

Proposition 65 requires that a clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products regarding the exposures to Lead caused by ordinary use of the product. The Parties are in violation of Proposition 65 by failing to provide such warning to consumers and as a result of the sales of this product, exposures to Lead have been occurring without proper warnings.

Pursuant to Proposition 65, notice and intent to sue shall be provided to violators 60-days before filing a complaint. This letter provides notice of the alleged violation to the parties listed above and the appropriate governmental authorities. A summary of Proposition 65 is attached.

EHA identifies Fred Duran as a responsible individual within the entity, 12245 Carmel Vista Road, Unit 193, 92130; 915-312-2577. Mr. Duran requests all communications be sent to EHA's attorneys.

If you have any questions or wish to discuss any of the above, please contact me.

ENTORNO LAW, LLP

Noan Slich

Noam Glick

Jake Schulte Craig Nicholas

Enclosures

CERTIFICATE OF MERIT

I, Noam Glick, hereby declare:

1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged the parties identified in the notice have violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.

2. I am an attorney for the noticing party.

3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.

4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.

5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

Dated: August 10, 2023

Noon Slich

Noam Glick, Attorney at Law

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Racquel Fox, declare that I am over the age of 18 years, and am not a party to the within action. I am employed in the County of San Diego, California, where the mailing occurs; and my business address is 225 Broadway, 19th Floor, San Diego, California 92101.

On August 10, 2023, I served the following documents: (1) 60-DAY NOTICE OF VIOLATION SENT IN COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.7(d); (2) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT; (3) PROPOSITION 65: A SUMMARY; and (4) CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENT (served only on the Attorney General) on the parties listed below by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each party and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery by Certified Mail with the postage thereon fully prepaid:

Via Certified Mail

On Target Living, LLC Attn. Legal Dept. 35 Monarch Lane Okemos, MI 48864

On Target Living, LLC c/o Christopher B Johnson 211 Harrier Drive Bath, MI 48808 Amazon.com Inc. c/o Corporation Service Company 251 Little Falls Drive Wilmington, Delaware 19808

Amazon.com, Inc. Attn. Legal Dept 410 Terry Avenue North Seattle, WA 98109

On August 10, 2023, I served the California Attorney General (via website Portal) by uploading a trueand correct copy thereof as a PDF file via the California Attorney General's website.

On August 10, 2023, I transmitted via electronic mail the above-listed documents to the electronic mail addresses of the City and/or District Attorneys who have specifically authorized e-mail service and the authorization appears on the Attorney General's web site.

See Attached Service List

On August 10, 2023, I served the following persons and/or entities at the last known address by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope and depositing it at my business address with the U.S. Postal Service for delivery with the postage thereon fully prepaid, and addressed as follows:

See Attached Service List

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on August 10, 2023, at San Diego, California.

Racquel For Racquel For

APPENDIX A

OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986 (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY

The following summary has been prepared by the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), the lead agency for the implementation of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (commonly known as "Proposition 65"). A copy of this summary must be included as an attachment to any notice of violation served upon an alleged violator of the Act. The summary provides basic information about the provisions of the law, and is intended to serve only as a convenient source of general information. It is not intended to provide authoritative guidance on the meaning or application of the law. The reader is directed to the statute and OEHHA implementing regulations (see citations below) for further information.

FOR INFORMATION CONCERNING THE BASIS FOR THE ALLEGATIONS IN THE NOTICE RELATED TO YOUR BUSINESS, CONTACT THE PERSON IDENTIFIED ON THE NOTICE.

The text of Proposition 65 (Health and Safety Code Sections 25249.5 through 25249.13) is available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65law72003.html. Regulations that provide more specific guidance on compliance, and that specify procedures to be followed by the State in carrying out certain aspects of the law, are found in Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 25102 through 27001.¹ These implementing regulations are available online at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/P65Regs.html.

WHAT DOES PROPOSITION 65 REQUIRE?

The "Proposition 65 List." Under Proposition 65, the lead agency (OEHHA) publishes a list of chemicals that are known to the State of California to cause cancer and/or reproductive toxicity. Chemicals are placed on the Proposition 65 list if they are known to cause cancer and/or birth defects or other reproductive harm, such as damage to

¹ All further regulatory references are to sections of Title 27 of the California Code of Regulations unless otherwise indicated. The statute, regulations and relevant case law are available on the OEHHA website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html.

female or male reproductive systems or to the developing fetus. This list must be updated at least once a year. The current Proposition 65 list of chemicals is available on the OEHHA website at: <u>http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/prop65_list/Newlist.html</u>.

Only those chemicals that are on the list are regulated under Proposition 65. Businesses that produce, use, release or otherwise engage in activities involving listed chemicals must comply with the following:

Clear and reasonable warnings. A business is required to warn a person before "knowingly and intentionally" exposing that person to a listed chemical unless an exemption applies. The warning given must be "clear and reasonable." This means that the warning must: (1) clearly make known that the chemical involved is known to cause cancer, or birth defects or other reproductive harm; and (2) be given in such a way that it will effectively reach the person before he or she is exposed to that chemical. Some exposures are exempt from the warning requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

Prohibition from discharges into drinking water. A business must not knowingly discharge or release a listed chemical into water or onto land where it passes or probably will pass into a source of drinking water. Some discharges are exempt from this requirement under certain circumstances discussed below.

DOES PROPOSITION 65 PROVIDE ANY EXEMPTIONS?

Yes. You should consult the current version of the statute and regulations (http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/index.html) to determine all applicable exemptions, the most common of which are the following:

Grace Period. Proposition 65 warning requirements do not apply until 12 months after the chemical has been listed. The Proposition 65 discharge prohibition does not apply to a discharge or release of a chemical that takes place less than 20 months after the listing of the chemical.

Governmental agencies and public water utilities. All agencies of the federal, state or local government, as well as entities operating public water systems, are exempt.

Businesses with nine or fewer employees. Neither the warning requirement nor the discharge prohibition applies to a business that employs a total of nine or fewer employees. This includes all employees, not just those present in California.

Exposures that pose no significant risk of cancer. For chemicals that are listed under Proposition 65 as known to the State to cause cancer, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure occurs at a level that poses "no significant risk." This means that the exposure is calculated to result in not more than one excess case of cancer in 100,000 individuals exposed over a 70-year lifetime. The Proposition 65 regulations identify specific "No Significant Risk Levels" (NSRLs) for many listed carcinogens. Exposures below these levels are exempt from the warning requirement. See OEHHA's website at:

http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of NSRLs, and Section 25701 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures that will produce no observable reproductive effect at 1,000 times the level in question. For chemicals known to the State to cause reproductive toxicity, a warning is not required if the business causing the exposure can demonstrate that the exposure will produce no observable effect, even at 1,000 times the level in question. In other words, the level of exposure must be below the "no observable effect level" divided by 1,000. This number is known as the Maximum Allowable Dose Level (MADL). See OEHHA's website at: http://www.oehha.ca.gov/prop65/getNSRLs.html for a list of MADLs, and Section 25801 *et seq.* of the regulations for information concerning how these levels are calculated.

Exposures to Naturally Occurring Chemicals in Food. Certain exposures to chemicals that naturally occur in foods (i.e., that do not result from any known human activity, including activity by someone other than the person causing the exposure) are exempt from the warning requirements of the law. If the chemical is a contaminant² it must be reduced to the lowest level feasible. Regulations explaining this exemption can be found in Section 25501.

Discharges that do not result in a "significant amount" of the listed chemical entering any source of drinking water. The prohibition from discharges into drinking water does not apply if the discharger is able to demonstrate that a "significant amount" of the listed chemical has not, does not, or will not pass into or probably pass into a source of drinking water, and that the discharge complies with all other applicable laws, regulations, permits, requirements, or orders. A "significant amount" means any detectable amount, except an amount that would meet the "no significant risk" level for chemicals that cause cancer or that is 1,000 times below the "no observable effect" level for chemicals that cause reproductive toxicity, if an individual were exposed to that amount in drinking water.

² See Section 25501(a)(4).

HOW IS PROPOSITION 65 ENFORCED?

Enforcement is carried out through civil lawsuits. These lawsuits may be brought by the Attorney General, any district attorney, or certain city attorneys. Lawsuits may also be brought by private parties acting in the public interest, but only after providing notice of the alleged violation to the Attorney General, the appropriate district attorney and city attorney, and the business accused of the violation. The notice must provide adequate information to allow the recipient to assess the nature of the alleged violation. The notice must comply with the information and procedural requirements specified in Section 25903 of Title 27 and sections 3100-3103 of Title 11. A private party may not pursue an independent enforcement action under Proposition 65 if one of the governmental officials noted above initiates an enforcement action within sixty days of the notice.

A business found to be in violation of Proposition 65 is subject to civil penalties of up to \$2,500 per day for each violation. In addition, the business may be ordered by a court to stop committing the violation.

A private party may not file an enforcement action based on certain exposures if the alleged violator meets specific conditions. For the following types of exposures, the Act provides an opportunity for the business to correct the alleged violation:

- An exposure to alcoholic beverages that are consumed on the alleged violator's premises to the extent onsite consumption is permitted by law;
- An exposure to a Proposition 65 listed chemical in a food or beverage prepared and sold on the alleged violator's premises that is primarily intended for immediate consumption on- or off-premises. This only applies if the chemical was not intentionally added to the food, and was formed by cooking or similar preparation of food or beverage components necessary to render the food or beverage palatable or to avoid microbiological contamination;
- An exposure to environmental tobacco smoke caused by entry of persons (other than employees) on premises owned or operated by the alleged violator where smoking is permitted at any location on the premises;
- An exposure to listed chemicals in engine exhaust, to the extent the exposure occurs inside a facility owned or operated by the alleged violator and primarily intended for parking non-commercial vehicles.

If a private party alleges that a violation occurred based on one of the exposures described above, the private party must first provide the alleged violator a notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form.

A copy of the notice of special compliance procedure and proof of compliance form is included in Appendix B and can be downloaded from OEHHA's website at: http://oehha.ca.gov/prop65/law/p65law72003.html.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE LAW OR REGULATIONS...

Contact the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment's Proposition 65 Implementation Office at (916) 445-6900 or via e-mail at P65Public.Comments@oehha.ca.gov.

Revised: May 2017

NOTE: Authority cited: Section 25249.12, Health and Safety Code. Reference: Sections 25249.5, 25249.6, 25249.7, 25249.9, 25249.10 and 25249.11, Health and Safety Code.

E-Mail Service List

The Honorable Pamela Price	The Honorable Barbara Yook	The Honorable Stacey Grassini
Alameda County, District Attorney	Calaveras County, 891 Mountain Ranch Rd.	Contra Costa County, Deputy District
7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650	San Andreas, CA 95249	Attorney
Oakland, CA 94621	Phone: 209-754-6330	900 Ward Street
CEPDProp65@acgov.org	Prop65Env@co.calaveras.ca.us	Martinez, CA 94553
		sgrassini@contracostada.org
The Honorable Lisa A. Smittcamp,	The Honorable Thomas L. Hardy	The Honorable Michelle Latimer
Fresno County, District Attorney	Inyo County, District Attorney	Lassen County, Program Coordinator
2100 Tulare Street	168 North Edwards Street	220 S. Lassen Street
Fresno, CA 93721	Independence, CA 93526	Susanville, CA 96130
Phone: (559) 600-3141	Phone: 760.878.0282	Phone: 530-251-8284
consumerprotection@fresnocountyca.gov	inyoda@inyocounty.us	mlatimer@co.lassen.ca.us
The Honorable Walter W. Wall,	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis,	The Honorable Jeannine M. Pacioni,
Mariposa County, District Attorney	Merced County, District Attorney	Monterey County, District Attorney
P.O. Box 730	550 West Main Street	1200 Aguajito Road
Mariposa, CA 95338 Phone: (209) 966-3626	Merced, CA 95340	Monterey, CA 93940
mcda@mariposacounty.org	Phone: (209) 385-7381	Prop65DA@co.monterey.ca.us
meda@manposacounty.org	Prop65@countyofmerced.com	
The Honorable Allison Haley	The Honorable Clifford H. Newell	The Honorable Morgan Briggs Gire
Napa County, District Attorney	Nevada County, District Attorney	Placer County, District Attorney
1127 First Street, Suite C	201 Commercial Street	10810 Justice Center Drive
Napa, CA 94559	Nevada City, CA 95959	Roseville, CA 95678
CEPD@countyofnapa.org	DA.Prop65@co.nevada.ca.us	Phone: 916-543-8000
The Henerell I Desid Hellister	The Heneral I. Devil F. Zellenheich	prop65@placer.ca.gov
The HonorabbleDavid Hollister Plumas County, District Attorney	The Honorable Paul E. Zellerbach Riverside County, District Attorney	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert Sacramento County, District Attorney
520 Main St.	3072 Orange Street	901 G Street
Quincy, CA 95971	Riverside, CA 92501	Sacramento, CA 95814
Phone: (530) 283-6303	Prop65@rivcoda.org	Prop65@sacda.org
davidhollister@countyofplumas.com		
The Honorable Summer Stephan	The Honorable Alexander Grayner	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar
San Diego County, District Attorney	San Francisco County, Asst. District Attorney	San Joaquin County, District Attorney
330 West Broadway	350 Rhode Island Street	222 E. Weber Avenue, Room 202
San Diego, CA 92101	San Francisco, CA 94103	Stockton, CA 95202
SanDiegoDAProp65@sdcda.org	alexandra.grayner@sfgov.org	DAConsumer.Environmental@sjcda.org
The Honorable Eric J. Dobroth, San Luis	The Honorable Christopher Dalbey	The Honorable Bud Porter
Obispo County, Deputy District Attorney	Santa Barbara County, Deputy District Attorney	Santa Clara County, Supervising Deputy
County Government Center Annex, 4th Floor	1112 Santa Barbara St.	District Attorney
San Luis Obispo, CA 93408	Santa Barbara, CA 93101	70 W Hedding St
Phone: 805-781-5800 edobroth@co.slo.ca.us	Phone: 805-568-2300 DAProp65@co.santa-barbara.ca.us	San Jose, CA 95110 EPU@da.sccgov.org
The Honorable Jeffrey S. Rosell	The Honorable Jill Ravitch	The Honorable Phillip J. Cline
Santa Cruz County, District Attorney 701 Ocean Street	Sonoma County, District Attorney	Tulare County, District Attorney
Santa Cruz, CA 95060	600 Administration Drive Santa Rosa, CA 95403	221 S Mooney Blvd Visalia, CA 95370
Phone: 831-454-2400	Jeannie.Barnes@sonoma-county.org	Prop65@co.tulare.ca.us
Prop65DA@santacruzcounty.us	Seame.Dames@sononia-county.org	Tiopos accontaina concastas
The Honorable Gregory D. Totten	The Honorable Jeff W. Resig	The Honorable Mark Ankcorn
Ventura County, District Attorney	Yolo County, District Attorney	City of San Diego, Deputy City Attorney
800 S Victoria Ave	301 Second Street	1200 Third Avenue
Ventura, CA 93009	Woodland, CA 95695	San Diego, CA 92101
daspecialops@ventura.org	cfepd@yolocounty.org	CityAttyProp65@sandiego.gov
	The Honorable Nora V. Frimann	
The Honorable Henry Lifton		
City of San Francisco, Deputy City Attorney	City of Santa Clara, City Attorney	
City of San Francisco, Deputy City Attorney 1390 Market Street, 7th Floor	City of Santa Clara, City Attorney 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor	
City of San Francisco, Deputy City Attorney	City of Santa Clara, City Attorney	

MAIL SERVICE LIST

The Honorable Robert Priscaro	The Honorable Todd Riebe	The Honorable Michael L. Ramsey
Alpine County, District Attorney	Amador County, District Attorney	Butte County, District Attorney
P.O. Box 248	708 Court Street, #202	25 County Center Drive - Administrative Building
Markleeville, CA 96120	Jackson, CA 95642	Oroville, CA 95965
The Honorable Brenden Farrell	The Honorable Katherine Micks	The Honorable Vernon Pierson
Colusa County, District Attorney	Del Norte County, District Attorney	El Dorado County, District Attorney
310 6 th Street	450 H Street, Room 171	778 Pacific Street
Colusa, CA 95932	Crescent City, CA 95531	Placerville, CA 95667
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart	The Honorable Stacey Eads	The Honorable George Marquez
Glenn County, District Attorney	Humboldt County, District Attorney	Imperial County, District Attorney
P.O. Box 430	825 5th Street	940 West Main Street, Suite 102
Willows, CA 95988	Eureka, CA 95501	El Centro, CA 92243
The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer	The Honorable Sarah Hacker	The Honorable Susan Krones
Kern County, District Attorney	Kings County, District Attorney	Lake County, District Attorney
1215 Truxtun Avenue	1400 West Lacey Blvd.	255 N. Forbes Street
Bakersfield, CA 93301	Hanford, CA 93230	Lakeport, CA 95453
The Honorable George Gascon	The Honorable Sally O. Moreno	The Honorable Lori Frugoli
Los Angeles County, District Attorney	Madera County, District Attorney	Marin County, District Attorney
211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200	209 West Yosemite Avenue	3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130
Los Angeles, CA 90012	Madera, CA 93637	San Rafael, CA 94903
The Honorable C. David Eyster	The Honorable Cynthia Campbell	The Honorable David Anderson
Mendocino County, District Attorney	Modoc County, District Attorney	Mono County, District Attorney
P.O. Box 1000	204 S. Court Street, Room 202	P.O. Box 2053
Ukiah, CA 95482	Alturas, CA 96101	Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Todd Spitzer	The Honorable Joel Buckingham	The Honorable Jason Anderson
Orange County, District Attorney	San Benito County, District Attorney	San Bernardino County, District Attorney
300 N. Flower Street	419 4th Street	303 W. Third Street
Santa Ana, CA 92703	Hollister, CA 95023	San Bernardino, CA 92415
The Honorable Stephen M. Wagstaffe	The Honorable Stephanie A. Bridgett	The Honorable Sandra Groven
San Mateo County, District Attorney	Shasta County, District Attorney	Sierra County, District Attorney
400 County Center, Third Floor	1355 West Street	100 Courthouse Square
Redwood City, CA 94063	Redding, CA 96001	Downieville, CA 95936
The Honorable James Kirk Andrus	The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams	The Honorable Jeff Laugero
Siskiyou County, District Attorney	Solano County, District Attorney	Stanislaus County, District Attorney
P.O. Box 986	675 Texas Street, Suite 4500	832 12th Street, Suite 300
Yreka, CA 96097	Fairfield, CA 94533	Modesto, CA 95353
The Honorable Jennifer Dupre	The Honorable Matthew Rogers	The Honorable David Brady
Sutter County, District Attorney	Tehama County, District Attorney	Trinity County, District Attorney
463 2nd Street, Suite 102	P.O. Box 519	P.O. Box 310
Yuba City, CA 95991	Red Bluff, CA 96080	Weaverville, CA 96093
The Honorable Cassandra Jenecke	The Honorable Clint Curry	The Honorable Mike Feuer
Tuolumne County, District Attorney	Yuba County, District Attorney	City of Los Angeles, City Attorney
423 N. Washington Street	215 Fifth Street, Suite 152	200 N. Main Street
Sonora, CA 95370	Marysville, CA 95901	Los Angeles, CA 90012